LIFE AFTER DEATH In the Intertestamental Palestine Context

Xavier Terrence

1. Introduction

The intertestamental history of the people of Israel, the Jews, marked a new kind of identity, an identity amidst the silence of God. The humiliating experience of slavery and their acquaintance with the foreign culture, religion and philosophy had its own influence on them. This was further aggravated by the Hellenistic and Roman culture and philosophy through invasions. In addition, there was no new revelation from God. This experience made a great impact in their understanding of life and death: while looking for a survival in terms of nation as a whole, they tried also to see a survival beyond death in the form of resurrection. This new climate of religious and philosophical thinking and expression favoured Jesus and the early Church towards quite a new understanding of life, death and afterlife. Most of these writings are of apocalyptic nature. A word on apocalyptic, the *Child of Prophecy*, would surely help us to understand its importance.

The milieu of Jewish apocalyptic literature covers roughly from about 200 BCE to about 100 CE. The postexilic context of Israel encouraged the cryptic and apocalyptic character of the oracles and message due to the political and religious turbulence. The importance of apocalyptic literature lies in its function as a bridge which links, rather continues, the prophetic tradition of the Hebrew Bible and the prophetic mission of Jesus by opening a new way to think and interpret.² E. Käsemann's strong conviction that "Apocalyptic is the mother of Christian

Dr T. Xavier Terrence, a Catholic priest from the Diocese of Palayamkottai, India, is a professor of Theology at St. Peter's Pontifical Institute, Bangalore, India. He holds a Licentiate in Biblical Theology and a Doctorate in Patrology.

¹J. J. Collins, "Apocalyptic Eschatology as the Transcendence of Death," *CBQ* 36 (1974), 21-43, 22.

²D. S. Russell, *Apocalyptic: Ancient and Modern*, Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1978, 38-29; D. S. Russell, *The Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic*, Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1964, 15, 24-26, 74, 127-133, 181-183; R. H. Charles, *Lectures on the Apocalypse*, London: Oxford University Press, 1923, 1-2, 6.

theology"3 finds its meaning in this context. Here we are more concerned with the linguistic and cultural milieu than a territorial one. We take the works originally written either in Hebrew or in Aramaic.⁴ From this background we study the concept of Life after Death among the People of God in the intertestamental Palestinian context.

2. The Book of Jubilees

The Book of Jubilees (ca. 200-105 B.C.E.) is mostly a midrashical⁵ explanation of the stories in Genesis and in Exodus, till the 14th chapter.6 While speaking of the importance of the Law and its observance with all its severity, it explains about the afterlife in 23:30-31: ³⁰Then the Lord will heal his servants. They will rise and see great peace.... ³¹Their bones will rest in the earth and their spirits will be very happy.⁷

The first part of v.30 resembles very much Hosea 6:2 that Yahweh would heal the people, the nation as a military and political unit, and raise them to live in His presence. The second part is close to Daniel 12:2, which speaks about the two kinds of retribution. It would mean the defeat of the enemy by Israel and a prolonged happy life of the people of Yahweh. On the contrary, v.31 points to a situation after death. In v.31 we see a denial of the bodily resurrection and an affirmation of the Greek concept of the immortality of the soul. It could be a good pointer to the development of the post-exilic concept of the afterlife.8

In fact, in v.31 the focal point rests in the idea of the final role of God in the struggle of the Jews and of the *hesed* (kindness) of Yahweh. The author wants the reader to understand that the death of the just, who remained faithful even unto death, did not go in vain and that God will

³E. Käsemann, "The Beginning of Christian Theology," 82-107, in E. Käsemann, ed., The New Testament Questions of Today, London: SCM Press Ltd., 1969, 102.

⁴The portions in the Canonical Books of the Hebrew Bible and the Rabbinic Literature are not taken into consideration for our study.

⁵Midrash in Hebrew means 'Interpretation' or 'Exposition'.

⁶A-M. Denis, Introduction aux Pseudépigraphes Grecs d'Ancien Testament, SVTP-I, Leiden: E. G. Brill, 1970, 150.

⁷J. C. Vanderkam, trans., *The Book of Jubilees*, Lovanii: Aedibus E. Peeters, 1989, 149.

⁸P. Volz, Die Eschatologie der jüdischen Gemeinde im neutestamentlichen Zeitalter, Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1934, 28; G. L. Davenport, The Eschatology of the Book of Jubilees, SPB-20, Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1971, 40; H. C. C. Cavallin, *Life after Death*, Part I, Coniectanea Biblica – New Testament Series – 7:1, Lund: CWK Gleerup, 1974, 38. Compare it with Wisdom 2:22-24.

vindicate their death.9 He proposes a post-mortem and pre-resurrection transition of the dead: passing from the dark (passive, shadowy idea of Sheol – Underworld) into a more lively existence in the happiness of the souls. But these concepts are not woven well to give a proper teaching on the afterlife. Considering the context of vv.30-31 and the religious unrest of the time of the author, these verses seem to warn the Jews against the adaptation of foreign religious practices and the subsequent divine punishment.

2. Ethiopic Enoch (1 Enoch)

Enoch, being a close friend of God (Genesis 5:24; Sirach 44:16; 49:14; Hebrew 11:5), attracted the attention of the Jews because he was taken to heaven. They considered him to be the right person to reveal the mysteries. The most important work on him is Ethiopic Enoch or 1Enoch. The whole book is divided into five parts or sections and the date of each section varies from *ca*. 300 B.C.E. to 70 C.E.¹⁰

In the first section, in chapter 22 the author describes the abode of the souls¹¹ being explained by the holy angel Raphael:

³These beautiful places (are intended for this) that the spirits, the souls of the dead, might be gathered into them; for them they were created, (that) here they might gather all the souls of the sons of men.

⁹G. W. E. Nickelsburg, Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism, HTS-26, Cambridge/London: Harvard University Press/Oxford University Press, 1972, 32; G. L. Davenport, The Eschatology of the Book of Jubilees, 40; P. Volz, Die Eschatologie der jüdischen Gemeinde im neutestamentlichen Zeitalter, 29.

¹⁰Genesis 5:24; Sirach 44:16; 49:14; G. Vermes, The Complete Dead Sea Scrolls in English, London: Penguin Books, 1997, 513; P. Vielhauer, "Jesus und der Menschensohn," ZThK 60 (1963), 133-177, 169; J. C. Hindley, "Towards a Date for the Similitudes of Enoch: An Historical Approach," NTS 14 (1967/68), 551-565, 562-564.

¹¹There are four types of habitats prepared for the souls of the dead. The primary one is reserved for the Just like Abel and the others for the sinners. The habitat of the Just is brilliant with a fountain of refreshing water. On the contrary, in the other habitats there are various types of tortures. But these habitats are provisory where the souls wait for a new kind of existence yet to come. Cf. P. Grelot, De la Mort a la Vie Éternelle, Lectio Divina-67, Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1971, 210; P. Grelot further compares these habitats with that of the Ancient Greek Mytholigies. Cf. P. Grelot, "L'eschatologie des Esséniens et le livre d'Hénoch," RO 1 (1958), 113-131, 124-127.

⁴And these places they made where they will keep them until the day of their judgment...

¹⁰Likewise (a place) has been created for sinners when they die and are buried in the earth and judgment has not come upon them during their life... ¹³Thus (a place) has been created for the souls of men who are not righteous, but sinners, accomplished in wrongdoing, and with the wrongdoers will be their lot. But their souls will not be killed on the day of judgment, nor will they rise from here.

There are some important points to be noted: There is an intermediate existence after death; there will be an end to this existence; and they will be judged. Hence the souls of the righteous are supposed to vacate this place. On the contrary, the souls of the wicked are kept apart and there will be no return from their place. The implied resurrection in this passage points to a kind of transfer of the souls at judgment.¹²

The Second section, on the contrary, gives an example in a concrete way for the resurrection of the body. In 51:1 we read,

And in those days the earth will return that which has been entrusted to it, and *Sheol* will return that which has been entrusted to it, that which it has received and destruction will return what it owes.

It is very clear to understand that the earth will hand over the dead bodies and the *Sheol* their souls. The author does not limit this responsibility only to these two. He includes those who have died elsewhere in some other mode (61:5),

And these measurements will reveal all the secrets of the depths of the earth, and those who were destroyed by the desert, and those who were devoured by the fish of the sea and by animals, that they may return and rely on the day of the Chosen One; for no one will be destroyed before the Lord of Spirits, and no one can be destroyed.

If it is only the soul which is to be resurrected or which is to be judged, then it is absurd to think of the body to be revived. So the idea that emerges here is evidently that of the resurrection of the body. It is extended not only to those who died during the religious persecutions but

¹²G. W. E. Nickelsburg is of the opinion that there will be a transfer of the souls at judgment and says, "The author appears to view this transferral as a kind of 'resurrection,' for he says that the spirits of the sinners in the other compartment 'will not be raised from there." Cf. G. W. E. Nickelsburg, Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism, 136-137; K. Schubert, "Die Entwicklung der Auferstehungslehre von den nachexilischen bis zur frührabbinischen Zeit, BZ 6 (1962) 177-214, 192.

also to those who died for various reasons, in various modes and in different places. We also find some passages in this section which mention a kind of afterlife without bodily resurrection (37:4; 40:9; 58:3; 108:11).¹³

In the fifth section towards the end he speaks of the resurrection of the sinners (108: 11-15):

11...and I will transform those who were born in darkness, who in the flesh were not recompensed with honour, as was fitting to their faith. ¹⁴And they will see those who were born in darkness thrown into darkness, while the righteous shine. ¹⁵And the sinners will cry out as they see them shining, but they themselves will go where days and times have been written down for them.

From all these passages a few points are clear: There will be a bodily restoration. For this reason the souls have to wait patiently in their temporary abode. But how the restoration would be effected is not clear in the arguments of the author. In some parts there is confusion between a resurrection of the body and a resurrection of the soul. The exhortation in 104:4 and a few other elements point to a kind of national restoration of the Jews with a New Jerusalem and a New Temple. 14 To convince the righteous who are alive and those who suffer, the author is claiming the authenticity of the information through a first-hand conversation with the holy angel Raphael and a first-hand visit through cosmic journey.

3. The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs

They are a collection of discourses under the name of the twelve Patriarchs to their descendants to pass on the spiritual and material legacy. This collection is considered to be a pre-Christian Jewish writing redacted and edited by the Christians. Though the main thrust of these testaments is 'waiting for two Messiahs,' we find some resurrection passages. The main characteristics of the resurrection passages can be summarised as follows:

¹³R. H. Charles, *The Ethiopic Book of Enoch*, London: SPCK, 1952, 69; P. Grelot, "L'eschatologie des Esséniens et le livre d'Hénoch," 121f.

Schubert, "Die Entwicklung der Auferstehungslehre von den nachexilischen bis zur frührabbinischen Zeit," 192; L. Hartman, Prophecy interpreted: The Formation of some Jewish Apocalyptic Texts and of the Eschatological Discourse Mark 13 par, Coniectanea Biblica: New Testament Series-1, Lund: CWK Gleerup, 1966, 112-126.

¹⁵A Priestly Messiah from the tribe of Levi (T. Reuben 6:7-12; T. Judah 21:2ff) and a *Kingly Messiah* from the tribe of Judah (T. Judah 24:5-6).

Then you will see Enoch, Noah and Shem and Abraham and Isaac and Jacob rising on the right hand in gladness (T. Benjamin 10:6).

Then Abraham and Isaac and Jacob will exult, and I, too, shall be glad, and all the saints will put on joy (T. Levi 18: 14).

And after these things Abraham and Isaac and Jacob will arise unto life... (T. Judah 25:1).

3.2. Resurrection of the Twelve Patriarchs

Then I shall arise in joy and I shall bless the Most High because of his marvellous works, for God, taking a body and eating with men, saved men (T. Simeon 6:7).

And after these things Abraham and Isaac and Jacob will arise unto life, and I and my brothers will be chiefs of our tribes in Israel: Levi first, I second, Joseph third, Benjamin fourth, Simeon fifth, Issachar sixth and, so all in order (T. Judah 25:1).

And now, my children, do not grieve that I die nor be cast down that I pass away. For I shall rise again in the midst of you as a ruler in the midst of his sons, and I shall rejoice in the midst of my tribe as many as have kept the law of the Lord and the commandments of Zebulun their father (T. Zebulun 10:1-2).

Then we also will rise each one over our tribe, worshipping the king of heaven who appeared on earth in the form of a man of humility; and as many as believed in him on earth, will rejoice with him (T. Benjamin 10:7).

3.3. Resurrection of the Righteous and the Gentiles Who Believed in God

And he will open the gates of paradise and will stop the threatening sword against Adam. And he will give to the saints to eat from the tree of life and the spirit of holiness will be upon them (T. Levi 18:10-11).

And those who have died in grief will arise in joy and those who were in poverty for the Lord's sake will be made rich and those who were in want will be fed and those who were in weakness will be strong and those who died for the Lord's sake will awake to life (T. Judah 25:4).

And he will take the captivity from Beliar, the souls of the saints, and he will turn disobedient hearts to the Lord and he will give eternal peace to those who call upon him. And the saints will rest in Eden and the righteous will rejoice in the new Jerusalem, which will be to the glory of the Lord forever... And he who believes in him will be king in truth in the heavens (T. Dan 5:11-13).

Then also all men will rise, some unto glory and some unto shame. And the Lord will judge Israel first for the unrighteousness done to him, because they did not believe that God appeared in the flesh as a deliverer. And then he will judge all the Gentiles as many as did not believe him when he appeared on earth (T. Benjamin 10:8-9).

3.4. Resurrection: A Reversal in the Fortune of Humankind

And those who have died in grief will arise in joy and those who were in poverty for the Lord's sake will be made rich and those who were in want will be fed and those who were in weakness will be strong and those who died for the Lord's sake will awake to life (T. Judah 25:4). For if the soul departs troubled, it is tormented by the evil spirit, whom it also served in its desires and evil works. But if (it departs) quietly in joy, he (the man) has recognized the angel of peace, who will comfort him with life (T. Asher 6:5-6).

A general resurrection is being spoken of here in the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs. But there are some difficulties. No details of the resurrection and the intermediate state of the soul are explained. In Asher 6:5-6, the survival of the righteous and the sinners is mentioned. It stresses the immortality of the soul. 16 A New Jerusalem is proposed as the location for the resurrected people but the topography is not explained (Daniel 5:12). With all these characteristics, the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs give a somewhat vivid expression on the resurrection. It could mean the restoration of the twelve tribes and the reconstitution of Israel as well as the resurrection of those who died for the sake of the religion.¹⁷

¹⁶It points to the 'Theology of Two Ways' which was familiar in the Qumran Community and in Wisdom 1-5. It could be also due to Greek influence. Cf. G. W. E. Nickelsburg, Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism, 156-159, 161-164.

¹⁷E. Bickerman, Studies in Jewish and Christian History, Part 2, Leiden, E. J. Brill, 1980, 1-5, 23; J. T. Milik, "Le Testament de Lévi en Araméen," RB 62 (1955), 398-406, 405-406; M. De Jonge, "The main Issues in the Study of the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs," 509, 512-516; J. C. Greenfield and M. E. Stone, "Remarks from the Aramaic Testament of Levi from the Geniza," RB 86 (1979), 214-230, 225, 227-227; M. De Jonge, "The Pre-Mosaic Servants of God in the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs and in the Writings of Justin and Irenaeus," VC 39 (1985), 157-170, 160-161; M. De Jonge, "The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs: Christian and Jewish," 233-243, in M. De Jonge, ed., Jewish Eschatology, Early Christian Christology and the Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs, SNT-63, Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1991, 238.

4. Psalms of Solomon

It is a collection of hymns associated with the name of Solomon (Second half of the first century B.C.E.) in order to have a patronage. Like the canonical Psalms, one thinks of a few authors and more than one context which could represent the views of the Pharisaic line of thought or that of a common folk. The author in 3:10-12 speaks of resurrection in order to encourage the righteous:

¹⁰He adds sin upon sin in his life; he falls – his fall is serious – and he will not get up. ¹¹The destruction of the sinner is forever, and he will not be remembered when (God) looks after the righteous. ¹²This is the share of sinners forever, but those who fear the Lord shall be in the Lord's light, and it shall never end.

Here we find two perfectly contrasting situations of the righteous and of the sinners. The righteous, due to the intervention of God, will be raised to a new life. This presumed resurrection is explained in the context of divine glory as a promise to the righteous. But in vv.5-8 the author speaks about the fall of the righteous due to their sins. They do penance and look for divine help. On the contrary, in vv.9-11we read that the sinners go on piling their sins. In this context the *rising* means to rise from among the sins in order to begin a new life. These verses speak of the *light of the Lord* which does not mean heaven or heavenly setting, rather points to the happy or fortunate life and the blessedness of the righteous. It is very difficult to extract the exact notion of resurrection from this Psalm. But it is clear that the use of the concept of resurrection was gaining its ground in the context of the author. The author does not make use of the national concept but of the virtue of righteousness.

5. Qumran Writings

The sectarian community of Qumran, known for their theology and piety, had its origin in the religious and national reformation movement in the

¹⁸G. Stemberger, *Der Leib der Auferstehung*, An. Bib.-56, Rome: Biblical Institute Press, 1972, 60.

¹⁹J. O'Dell, "The Religious Background of the Psalms of Solomon," *RQ* 3 (1961) 241-257, 241-249; J. L. Trafton, "The Psalms of Solomon: New Light from the Syriac Version?" *JBL* 105 (1986) 227-237, 229; J. Begrich, "Der Text der Psalmen Salomos," *ZNW* 38 (1939) 131-164, 131, 163-164; A-M. Denis, *Introduction aux Pseudépigraphes Grecs d'Ancien Testament*, 63-64; G. W. E. Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism*, 131-132, 134; J. Schüpphaus, *Die Psalmen Salomos*, LGHJ-7, Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1977, 30-31.

first half of the second century BCE.²⁰ The birth of this community and its life in the midst of the religious persecutions under Antiochus Epiphanes and then the Romans were nourished by the prophesy of Habakkuk 2:4. In interpreting this verse, the commentator writes in 4QpHab 8:1-3, "This concerns all those who observe the Law in the house of Judah, whom God will deliver from the House of Judgment because of their suffering and because of their faith in the Teacher of righteousness."21 This gave rise for the discussion on their belief in the resurrection of the body which made the scholars argue for and against.²² Let us take into consideration some of the texts that might highlight some more insights into the concept of death and thereafter.

5.1. Resurrection Fragment (4Q521)

It is known as 'A Messianic Apocalypse' but often referred to as 'Resurrection Fragment.' The poetical content of this fragment is dated to the first century B.C.E. It speaks of a Messiah who would stand on the side of the poor and oppressed to change their present precarious conditions.²³ Two quotations possibly give an explicit reference to the resurrection:

²⁰Damascus Document 1:5-8. Cf. G. Vermes, The Complete Dead Sea Scrolls in English, 127; R. E. Brown, et al, "Apocrypha; Dead Sea Scrolls; Other Jewish Literature," NJBC, 1073-1074.

²¹The translations of the Qumran manuscripts are taken from G. Vermes, *The* Complete Dead Sea Scrolls in English and É. Puech, "Une apocalypse messianique (40521)," RO 15 (1991-1992), 475-519, 486.

²²Taking into consideration the Community Rule IV: 6-8, 11-13 and the War Scroll XII:1-7, J. Carmignac explains the 'theology of resurrection' in Qumran with other references favouring a kind of resurrection. He is very cautious and finally concludes that one cannot actually deduce an affirmation on resurrection. R. Meyer refers to the members as Zadokites who deny resurrection. F. F. Bruce is of the opinion that there is a lot on the eternal life for the righteous but no clear light on the question of resurrection. K. Schubert does not see any direct pointer to resurrection. M. Mansoor, in f.n. 64, takes the expression those who lie in the dust and compares it with Isaiah 26:19; Job 7:21; 20:11; 21:26 and argues that it is a clear allusion to resurrection. For him the belief in resurrection was highly developed in the sect. Cf. J. Carmignac, "Le retour du Docteur de Justice à la fin des jours?" RQ 2 (1958), 235-248, 235-239 esp. 239; R. Meyer, "Σαδδουκαῖος," 35-54, in G. Friedrich, ed., TDNT, Vol.7, Grand Rapids: WM. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1971, 40-41; F. F. Bruce, "Paul on Immortality," ScJTh 24 (1971), 457-472, 459; K. Schubert, "Die Entwicklung der Auferstehungslehre von der nachexilischen bis zur frührabbinischen Zeit," 202-203; M. Mansoor, "Studies in the *HODAYOT* – IV," *JBL* 76 (1957), 139-148, 146.

²³G. Vermes, "Qumran Forum Miscellanea I," *JJS* 43 (1992), 299-305, 303; G. Vermes, The Complete Dead Sea Scrolls in English, 391.

2:12 For He will heal the wounded, and revive the dead and bring good news to the poor.

7:6 The Giver of life will resurrect the dead of His people.

It is interesting to note the overtones of Hosea 6:1-2 in the first passage. Often the expressions of *healing* and *reviving* refer to the restoration of the nation. But here we have a new element in addition, *bringing good news to the poor*, which brings this fragment closer to the context of suffering people. The context of this line suggests that the author encourages the *Seekers of the Lord* to strengthen themselves in order to find Him. On the contrary 7:6 uses clear terminologies regarding the dead and their raising. The author's belief in the general resurrection of the righteous is expressed in terms of a re-creation by the Creator God.²⁴

5.2. *Hôdayôt* (Thanksgiving Hymn)

These hymns are individual prayers and they are similar to the biblical Psalms. The *two-way theology* and *salvation* form fundamental themes.²⁵

^{29b}...and all the sons of His truth shall awake to (overthrow) wickedness; ³⁴Hoist a banner, O you who lie in the dust! O bodies gnawed by worms, raise up an ensign for (the destruction of wickedness)! (The sinful shall) be destroyed in the battles against the ungodly (1QH VI, 29b, 34).

...and destroying my flesh for seasons on end (1QH VIII, 31).

...that bodies gnawed by worms may be raised from the dust to the counsel (of Thy truth)... (1QH XI, 12).

These passages centre on a single theme: the final battle between the righteous and the wicked. The suffering was slow, steady and sharp like the suffering of the flesh gnawed by worms. This figurative description signifies nothingness and destitution of the Just and may not refer to those

²⁴This expression can be traced back to Isaiah 61:1 and Psalm 146:6-8, which is referred to more clearly in Luke 4:18. The announcement of Isaiah 61:1 is repeated to the contemporaries of the author of this fragment to fit into their actual situation or as an announcement of future salvation one finds in Palestinian Judaism. Its context, Line 2-3 makes it clear: "Seekers of the Lord, strengthen yourselves in His service! All you hopeful in (your) heart, will you not find the Lord in this?" Cf. G. Vermes, *The Complete Dead Sea Scrolls in English*, 391; É. Puech, "*Une apocalypse messianique* (4Q521)," 493, 505.

²⁵G. W. E. Nickelsburg, Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism, 146; H. C. C. Cavallin, Life after Death, 63; G. Vermes, The Complete Dead Sea Scrolls in English, 243-244.

who have died.²⁶ Hence it could be a revelation regarding the future. These passages do not describe that one has suffered and died and that now the dead body is gnawed by worms and it should be raised. However these lines can be taken to refer to and explain a bodily resurrection. But for the members of the Qumran community it was a realized resurrection by one's adherence to the discipline of the community.²⁷

5.3. The Wicked and the Holy (4Q181)

This fragment explains the better position of the righteous and the adverse situation of the wicked after their death. In lines 3-4 the author writes:

In accordance with the mercies of God, according to His goodness and wonderful glory, He caused some of the sons of the world to draw near (Him)... to be counted with Him and in the community of the 'gods'...

Here the action of God is clearly expressed: to cause somebody to draw near. This action explains well the act of resurrection.²⁸

The Qumran passages we have referred to above make us think of a growing conviction on the bodily resurrection among the members of the

²⁶F. Nötscher and J. Carmignac could not find any clear and precise argument for the resurrection of the dead in these passages. At the same time they are not satisfied with the explanation of Licht for dust and worm in 1QH VI 34. The dust means for them, as in Psalm 113:7, the *poor* and the *needy*. They explain the worm of death, in reference to Isaiah 41:14, which refers to the people of Israel who were reduced to a low status by their enemies. J. v.d. Ploeg considers that the Qumran sect is eternal and one may trace out some kind of individual eternity. He is also of the opinion that dust does not bring those lying on it to the realm of death and resurrection. F. Nötscher, "Hodajot (Psalmenrolle)," BZ 2 (1958), 128-133, 132-133; J. Carmignac, "Le retour du Docteur de Justice à la fin des jours?" 237; J. van der Ploeg, "The Belief in Immortality in the Writings of Qumran," BO 18 (1961), 118-124, 122-123. Cf. Psalm 141:7-8; 143:3-4, 7; Jonah 2:2, 6; Lamentations 3:53, 55.

²⁷G. Greshake and J. Kremer, Resurrectio Mortuorum, Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1986, 61; K. Schubert, "Die Entwicklung der Auferstehungslehre von der nachexilischen bis zur frührabbinischen Zeit," 203; M. Mansoor, "Studies in the HODAYOT – IV," 146, f.n.64; G. W. E. Nickelsburg, Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism, 156. It could refer even to the entrance into the Christian community through baptism. Cf. Romans 6:3-11; Colossians 2:12-13; Ephesians 2:5-6; 5:14.

²⁸J. T. Milik suggests *eternal life* in his translation and J. Strugnell suggests an angelic life to the members. J. T. Milik, "Milkî-cedeg et Milkî-Reša' dans les Anciens Écrits Juifs et Chrétiens (I)," JJS 23 (1972) 95-144, 114; J. Strugnell, "Notes en marge du volume V des 'Discoveries in the Judean Desert of Jordan,'" RO 7 (1970), 163-276, 254.

community. The *Sitz im Leben* might have been the context of a religious persecution and a threat to the *chosen-ness* of the people of Yahweh. The disappointing suffering of the righteous and the encouraging happy life of the wicked are hoped strongly to be reversed in the life beyond the grave. The *flesh* and the *body* which suffered before entering into the grave would enjoy beyond the grave and the *flesh* and the *body* which enjoyed before entering into the grave would suffer beyond the grave. This expectation of the Qumran Eschatological Community indeed reflects Habakkuk 2:4. The archaeology in Qumran site, especially in the graveyard, adds further to their belief in the bodily resurrection.²⁹

6. Life of Adam and Eve

It is a Jewish haggadic³⁰ work which survives only in Latin and Greek (The Apocalypse of Moses). It might have been written between 100 BCE and 70 CE and it is known for Christian interpolations.³¹ The references on resurrection in this work are very much in tune with the creation story and try to set right the humanity to its original status.

10:2 And Eve wept, saying, "Woe is me! For when I come to the day of resurrection, all who have sinned will curse me, saying that Eve did not keep the command of God."

13:3 Then all the flesh from Adam up to the great day shall be raised such as shall be the holy people.

28:4 ...if you guard yourself from all evil, preferring death to it, at the time of resurrection I will raise you again, and then there shall be given to you from the tree of life, and you shall be immortal forever.

²⁹G. Vermes, "Qumran Forum Miscellanea I," 304; G. W. E. Nickelsburg, Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism, 144, f.n.1, 151; R. A. Horsley, Bandits, Prophets & Messiahs: Popular Movements in the Time of Jesus, Harrisburg: Trinity Press International, 1999, 25; R. E. Brown, et al, "Apocrypha; Dead Sea Scrolls; Other Jewish Literature," 1076-1077. J. J. Collins, "Apocalyptic Eschatology as the Transcendence of Death," 35. The north-south orientation of the graves, with the head at the south end, can be described as the desire of the community members to see the Paradise in the north as they would be raised in the general resurrection. M. Black, The Scrolls and Christian Origins, London: Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd., 1961, 141.

³⁰Of explanatory or homiletic nature.

³¹J. L. Sharpe, "The Second Adam in the Apocalypse of Moses," *CBQ* 35 (1973), 35-46, 35; J. H. Mozley, "The 'Vita Adae," *JThS* 30 (1929), 121-149, 121; D. S. Russell, *The Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic*, 59-60; H. C. C. Cavallin, *Life after Death*, 72; L. S. A. Wells, *The Books of Adam and Eve*, AP-2, 126-127.

- 32:4 Rise, Eve, from your repentance, for behold, Adam your husband has gone out of his body. Rise and see his spirit borne up to meet its maker.
- 41:3 Now I promise to you the resurrection; I shall raise you on the last day in the resurrection with every man of your seed.
- 43:2 And the archangel Michael said to Seth, "Thus you shall prepare for burial each man who dies until the day of resurrection."

These references speak of the universal resurrection of all human beings. Since the hero and the heroine of this work are Adam and Eve, the *Parents* of Humanity, the author deducts the reason to include the whole of humanity in the context of resurrection. It is because of their sin, the whole of humanity lost its status as originally intended by the Creator. And now the author is concerned to bring back the lost status through them. The references are clear enough to give an idea of the mystery of death: sin is the cause of death; at death the infused soul returns to its master (spiritual immortality); at resurrection all the *flesh* (the whole body/humanity) will be raised up; the evil heart that is inclined to sin and caused death will be removed that the people may not incur death once again; with the right understanding they will have recourse to the delights of the paradise in the presence of God.³²

7. Liber Antiquitatum Biblicarum, 4Ezra and 2Baruch

These three works are considered inter-dependent and so we consider them together. A midrashic work of Hebrew origin, Liber Antiquitatum Biblicarum (Pseudo-Philo) is available only in Latin. The period between 70 and 135 CE is said to be the time of its writing and the content of this work has some affinity to rabbinic tradition. 4Ezra is preserved fully only in Latin. It might have been written in between 90 and 120 CE. 2Baruch, a Hebrew or Aramaic work and translated in Greek, is now extant to us only in Syriac. The time of its writing is suggested to be the same as that of the 4 Ezra.³³ We find some references in these works on resurrection.

³²H. C. C. Cavallin, Life after Death, 59-60, 72-74; D. S. Russell, The Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic, 59-60; P. Volz, Die Eschatologie der jüdischen Gemeinde im neutestamentlichen Zeitalter, 49; J. L. Sharpe, "The Second Adam in the Apocalypse of Moses," 36, 39-40.

³³A-M. Denis, Introduction aux Pseudépigraphes Grecs d'Ancien Testament, 82, 93, 185; D. J. Harrington, "The Biblical Text of Pseudo-Philo's Liber Antiquitatum Biblicarum," CBQ 33 (1971) 1-17, 1-2; D. S. Russell, The Method & Message of Jewish Apocalyptic, 62-65; G. Stemberger, Der Leib der Auferstehung, 73, 106; L. Hartman, Prophecy Interpreted: The Formation of Some Jewish

... And I will bring the dead to life and raise up those who are sleeping from the earth ... that I may render to each according to his works and according to the fruits of his own devices, until I judge between the soul and the flesh (*Liber Antiquitatum Biblicarum* 3:10).

³¹And after seven days the world, which is not yet awake, shall be roused, and that which is corruptible shall perish. ³²And the earth shall give up those who are asleep in it, and the chambers shall give up the soul which have been committed to them (4Ezra 7:31-32).

All who have fallen asleep in hope of Him shall rise again. And it shall come to pass at that time that the treasuries will be opened in which is preserved the number of the souls of the righteous, and a multitude of souls shall be seen together in one assemblage of one thought, and the first shall rejoice and the last shall not be grieved (2Bar 30: 2).

And the dust will be called, and told, "Give back that which does not belong to you and raise up all that you have kept until its own time" (2Bar 42:8).

Raising those who sleep clearly indicates the resurrection of the body. The judgment of both body and soul³⁴ in these books further strengthens the argument that the body would be there to encounter the judgment. Resurrection is for all and not restricted only to the righteous.

While speaking about the resurrection of Moses, the author of *Liber Antiquitatum Biblicarum* says in 19:12,

... But neither angel nor man will know your tomb in which you are to be buried until I visit the world. And I will raise up you and your fathers from the land of Egypt in which you sleep, and you will come together...

A special living place is promised here. The *sleep* of the patriarchs in the OT finds its meaning here: a sleep of death from which they will be awakened.

Apocalyptic Texts and of the Eschatological Discourse Mark 13 par, 132; P. Volz, Die Eschatologie der jüdischen Gemeinde im neutestamentlichen Zeitalter, 35, 40; R. E. Brown, et al, "Apocrypha; Dead Sea Scrolls; Other Jewish Literature," 1062-1064; W. S. Towner, "Form-Criticism of Rabbinic Literature," *JJS* 24 (1973) 101-118, 114.

³⁴In these books we find in many places the separation between the body and the soul at death. Cf. *Liber Antiquitatum Biblicarum* 23:13; 28:3; 32:13; 33:4; 43:7; 44:10; 54:6; 62:9; 64:5-7; 4Ezra 7:78, 100. Yet, in *Liber Antiquitatum Biblicarum* 44:10 and 4 Ezra 4:33 the author speaks of some kind of consciousness. But G. Stemberger argues that they both are not opposed to each other. The idea that the body and the soul are together for judgment at resurrection is found in the rabbinic tradition, the parable of the Lame and the blind man. See G. Stemberger, *Der Leib der Auferstehung*, 104, 108.

The special place to live in and the act of being awakened suggest a bodily resurrection, because the resurrected people are to live a life in a place.

4Ezra compares the status of the intermediary existence between death and resurrection to pregnancy³⁵ in 4:42:

He said to me, "In Hades the chambers of the souls are like the womb. For just as a woman who is in travail makes haste to escape the pangs of birth, so also do these places hasten to give back those things that were committed to them from the beginning.

2Baruch on the contrary explains the status of the resurrected bodies in 50:2 and in 51:10.

^{50:2}For the earth will surely give back the dead at that time; it receives them now in order to keep them, not changing anything in their form. But as it has received them so it will give them back.

^{51:10}For they will live in the heights of that world and they will be like the angels and be equal to the stars. And they will be changed into any shape which they wished, from beauty to loveliness, and from light to splendour of glory.

Here we have two important developments. The body will be resurrected with all its characteristics in order to be identified for the sake of judgment. Once the judgment is passed, the bodies of the righteous will be transformed into a glorious one in the way each one likes. Yet, we do not find a clear doctrine on resurrection; rather it might have been used to exhort and reassure the people of the rewards beyond grave for their fidelity and good actions or to fight the denial or a doubt of the resurrection.³⁶

8. Conclusion

Resurrection is seen as a precondition of the judgment of humankind. Persecution, religious or political, has been the Sitz im Leben of resurrection motive in these writings. It is motivated by the problem of the suffering of the righteous and the value of their right conduct during their lifetime. The unfulfilled happy and peaceful life of the righteous person is postponed to the life after death. The concept of religious and national restoration is seen through the restoration of life beyond grave. Though

³⁵This comparison is very close to rabbinic thoughts. The Targum of Isaiah paraphrases 14:19 the same in a vivid way. Cf. J. F. Stenning, ed. and tr., The Targum of Isaiah, Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1953, 48-51; H. C. C. Cavallin, Life after Death, 83.

³⁶It is closer to the parallel reflections among the early Christian communities. Cf. 1Cor 15:35-54; 2Bar 52:7. G. Stemberger, Der Leib der Auferstehung, 94; H. C. C. Cavallin, Life after Death, 78, 89.

they deal with the concrete historical situations, many references point to a bodily resurrection. The shadowy and passive life in the Sheol gains a better position in the apocalyptic. There is an identification of the persons and therefore the souls are joyful. They eagerly look forward to resurrection. The material body is also given importance in some of the passages in the context of resurrection. The Hebrew anthropology was a real preoccupation in the Palestinian Jewish context.³⁷ The body destroyed through decomposition would come back to existence in all its respects and particularities. The authors trace the authenticity back to heavenly sources in order to convince the audience. We have also found traces of Greek philosophical and pharisaic influence in some of the passages. The authors tried to solve the contextual problem of evil and suffering of the righteous in a theological and apocalyptic manner. The unjust suffering and the untimely cruel death of the righteous amidst the silence of God inspired the people of God to look for answers beyond the silence of graveyard.

³⁷The Greeks thought that the body was considered as the *mortal shell of the immortal soul*. But the Hebrews thought that man is not conceived to be a duel fashion as *body* and *soul*, but synthetically as a unity of vital power or a psychophysical organism. Each member of the body is related to a psychical property. Hence man is, for the Hebrews, an animated body and not an incarnated soul. Man is regarded as a unity of personality, not a dichotomy of body and soul or a trichotomy of body, soul and spirit. Cf. K. Schubert, "*Die Entwicklung der Auferstehungslehre von der nachexilischen bis zur frührabbinischen Zeit*," 177-178. For the relation between the members of the body and psychical properties see, D. S. Russell, *The Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic*, 140-145; I. Abrahams, *Studies in Pharisaism and the Gospels*, New York: Ktav Publishing House, Inc., 1967, 98.