

BOOK REVIEWS

James D. Redington, S.J.

Vallabhacarya on the Love-Games of Kṛṣṇa

Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1983, pp x + 491

Indian spirituality and religiosity has expressed itself in different styles of literature. It has produced volumes of philosophy, mysticism, theological reflection and popular devotion. It has also produced marvellous combinations of these. The *Bhagavatapurana* is one of such illustrious works in which devotional experience is uniquely combined with aesthetic expressions and sentimental flow of language is well balanced with philosophical insights. This classic of Indian devotional literature is well known in the Indian *bhakti* tradition and Vallabhacarya's commentary on the work is certainly acclaimed as a book of great importance and authentic interpretation. Unfortunately much of the *bhakti* literature still remain untranslated to the western languages, partly because of the difficulty of translation and partly also because of the style of devotional traditions in India which are often confined to a certain sect or group. The leaders or priests of these sects understand Sanskrit or the original language of the scripture concerned and the gist of the writings is given by them to the common people in their mother-tongue. So there is very little force from within the group to make a western translation. However it is a great loss to the world literature that such jewels of devotional literature is not brought to light for wider reading and appreciation.

James D. Redington's remarkable work, *Vallabhacarya on the Love-Games of Kṛṣṇa*, is certainly a great contribution in this respect. The basic text of one of the devotional sects of Viṣṇu known as *Vallabhasambradaya* (Vallabha tradition) is the commentary Vallabhacarya wrote to the *Bhagavata Purana* under the name *Subhodini*. J. D. Redington is now presenting six key chapters of this work (chapters 29-33 and 35) to the Western readers in readable and reliable English. These chapters are arranged as the first six chapters of the book mentioned. The chapters are preceded by a long introduction of 47 pages in which Redington very well summarises the fundamental themes of Kṛṣṇa's love-games. Special attention is given to present Kṛṣṇa as the embodiment of *rasa* and its various forms. The *Bhagavata Purana* is not just a devotional work. It is also a treatise on aesthetics. "Thus,

besides the recognized and continually delighting beauty of the poetry and persons and surroundings which we find in this account, we have a very particular and elaborate consciousness of aesthetic beauty at work here." (p. 3). Vallabha, the commentator is very keenly aware of this. "This I find rather startling: that the archetypal games Kṛṣṇa has come to play with his chosen devotees—games meant to form the patterns for life and attitudes—should be compared to things so man-made as plays, paintings and musical performances." (p. 5) The second part of the introduction deals with other stylistic and technical aspects of translation.

It is obviously a difficult and very exacting task to render a faithful translation of such a classical work which abounds in words and expressions full of shade meanings to a foreign language which has a different rhythm of expressing similar thoughts and sentiments. Redington has struggled to bring out the original sense of the passages. (cf. p. 45). I cannot say whether he has succeeded hundred percent in this attempt. But his disinterested sincerity and seriousness in bringing out the real sense of any passage concerned is more than clear. So I am very much inclined to say that this is an unbiassed faithful translation of the above mentioned six chapters of *Subhodini*. However I do not know what impression do certain English words make on Indian readers. Compared to the Sanskrit original, certain English words fail to convey the emotional content to an Indian reader who is conversant with the Sanskrit expressions. One such word, which is a key word in the whole treatise, is *rasa*, the Indian counter word for the core of aesthetic experience, which is translated as 'mood'. (Pp 137, 138, 139, 141, 145 and passim). Though sufficiently explained as "nectar of mood", for an average Indian reader the English word "mood" is still associated with a pejorative connotation as something to be "freed from" whereas *rasa* as an ever flowing inner juice is the very life-spring of aesthetic as well as divine experience. Apart from nuances of meaning of such words, the translation is to be considered excellent. The translation is also rich with extensive footnotes with numerous references to the word from the original texts and interpretation of the same. The work also contains a very long appendix (Pp. 357-480) in which the whole translated portion is given in its original Sanskrit.

Benjamin Preciado Solis

The Krishna Cycle in the Puranas
(Themes and Motifs in a Heroic Saga)

Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 1984, Pp 151 + 74 plates, Rs 150-00

It is interesting to note that the author found that even Krishna alone could be a very vast subject of research and that any one who wanted to cover the topic in its totality, would have to write a multi-volume work to do full justice to the subject. Hence the author restricts himself to the study of the stories that formed the Krishna cycle found in their different versions. The point of reference for this study is the image of Krishna that is presented by the stories of the *Puranas*. With a view to identifying some of the sources where these stories could have had their origins and to place the legends about Krishna and Krishna cult chronologically, the author starts his research with the Vedic antecedents to the Krishna figure. The second chapter deals with the first historical evidence on Krishna up to the beginning of the Christian era, and an exhaustive survey is made of all the archaeological and literary evidences together with their interpretations and discussions by modern scholars. The third and fourth chapters analyse some of the most characteristic episodes in the Krishna legends to identify their underlying themes and motifs. Using folk-comparative method, the author also draws the attention of the readers to their resemblances to the legends of Hercules. The last chapter is a general survey of the Krishna legends preserved in the iconography up to the 10th century AD.

The book also provides a map of India showing main sites mentioned in the text, a bibliography, an index and a collection of 74 photographs of the plates, the iconographical evidences for the theories discussed in the text. The author is a Mexican scholar specialized in Indology. He is currently engaged in the preparation of a book on Ancient Indian Art and another on the Evolution of Traditional Concepts on Indian Society. His study on the Krishna cycle is certainly an authoritative and dependable source of information on the subject.

Thomas K.

Paul Deussen

(Tr.) V. M. Bedekar and G. B. Palsule

Sixty Upanishads of the Veda

Vol. 1 & 2, Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 1980, Rs. 150/- pp. 996.

The *Sechzig Upanishads des Veda* of Paul Deussen first appeared in 1897. The late Prof. V. M. Bedekar completed a little more than half of the entire work (to be exact, up to page 598, line 28 of this edition) of translation, when he unfortunately passed away on 3 January 1978. After his demise Dr G. B. Palsule took up the task of completing the translation. In the words of Deussen, "The *Upanishads* are for the *Veda*, what the New Testament is for the Bible." The foreward of Deussen to the first German edition stretches this comparison and it reveals some of the early motives of the western scholars in studying the Hindu scriptures. According to the author, a complete collection of the *Upanishads* is not possible. As regards his selection he writes, "Our choice includes first the eleven upanishads of the three older Vedas, then all those *Atharva-Upanishads* which occur with a certain regularity in all or most collections and the list of the *Upanishads* and which, thus appear to have attained a sort of canonical regard. Our choice of the sixty *Upanishads* offer, all in all, everything that is of interest from this field of literature."

The oldest *Upanishads* were considered as a constituent part of a Vedic school. The arrangement of Vedic literature, namely, Rgveda, Samaveda, Yajurveda and Atharaveda depends on the fact that the four chief priests, namely, the *Hotr*, the *Udgatr*, the *Adhvaryu* and the *Brahman* belong to a festive Soma Sacrifice. The handbook of the *Hotr* is the Rgveda, that of the *Udgatr* is the Samaveda, that of the *Adhvaryu* the Yajurveda. The *Brahman*, the chief priest, who leads the whole ceremony without interfering with the rules of the sacrifices has no special handbook but he must know all the three Vedas mentioned above. But in a later period he was artificially connected with the Atharvaveda. Every one of these priests require for carrying out his duties i) *Samhita* (a collection of materials from the Vedas), ii) a *Brahmana* (theological elucidation). The *Brahmana* can be classified under three categories: a) *Vidhi* (directives), b) *Arthavada* (explanation of an exegetical type), and c) *Vedanta* or *Upanishad* (theological and philosophical reflections about the essential nature of things). Every one of the four Vedas was taught in different 'Sakhas'

(branches) which deviated so much from one another in the treatment of the total material. This situation explains the increase in the number of the Upanishads.

The present work makes the claim that its choice includes "Everything that is of interest from this field of literature." Though it is difficult to admit that those *Upanishads* which are not included in this are of no worth it is true that Deussen's collection contains all those *Upanishads* of great reputation. The English translation also contains an extremely voluminous index compiled by Deussen for his German edition. Though its English version involved tremendous labour, it is a unique feature of the book and it has enhanced the utility of the book considerably. It would remain as an invaluable guide to all those who seek the wisdom of the *Upanishads*.

Thomas K.

Natan Katz

Buddhist Images of Human Perfection

(The Arahant of the Sutta Pitaka compared with the Bodhisattva and the Mahasiddha)

Delhi: Motilal Banasridass, xix + 320pp.

The present volume is an attempt to unveil the early Buddhist ideal of a perfect man, namely, an Arahant. After analysing the concept of Arahant Katz has compared it with concepts like *Bodhisattva* and *Mahasiddha*, which belong to Mahayana and Vajrayana schools, respectively. This is a textual and contextual study. The author has studied the Pali texts. His knowledge of the Pali language helps him to present the study in a convincing way. The book comprises six chapters. The first chapter deals with the formulae, expressions, occasions and symbols of the Arahant in the *Sutta Pitaka*. The next chapter considers the theme of meditation and analyses the concept of Arahant in the context of meditation. The third chapter states that the meditational attainments of an Arahant are very essential to his identity with the Buddha. In the fourth chapter the psychology of an Arahant is discussed and his relation to the world is considered in terms of his experience of the world. The next chapter explains the Arahant's relationship to the society. Here the image of Arahant is an active one, he helps and teaches others. The last

chapter mentions the philosophy of Arahant the Arahant and family concept is compared with Bodhisattva and Mahasiddha. This book evoke interest among the readers in so far as it gives an idea of an Arahant in the early Buddhism and, therefore, is a positive contribution to the study of early Buddhism.

Francis Parackal

Indurama Srivastva

Dhrupada

Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1980, xv + 151pp.

This book explores the study of the origin, history and structure of the Dhrupada composition which brings into focus a characteristic feature of the Indian musical tradition which has found expression all along. Dr Indurama Srivastva provides a comprehensive survey of the whole subject in all its aspects, and in trying to do so clarifies many problems which have confused many musicologists. This attempt serves to remove many misconceptions presently prevailing on the subject of Dhrupada. Dhrupada is a style of Indian classical music which was at its height in the 16th and 17th centuries. Like many other ancient styles of music, Dhrupada also fell into oblivion in the course of time and is now facing extinction. In fact the book helps one to learn about the Dhrupada style and provides the necessary knowledge to restore its vitality. The author has traced its origin as musical composition, basing her studies on the descriptions found in the Sanskrit treatises. The historical sketch is placed against the background of the literary development of the Dhrupada. With the analysis and translation of Dhrupada texts the author shows that the Dhrupada style was originally a very rich and vivid one. The book is the doctorate thesis of the author at the University of Utrecht.

Anto Amarnad

F.D. Lessing & A. Wayman

Introduction to the Buddhist Tantric Systems

(Translated from: Mkhas Grub Rje's "*Rgyud sde spyihi rnam par gz'ag pa rgyas par brjod*" with original text and annotation).

Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1978 (2nd ed.), 352pp.

The Buddhist Tantric System is an outcome of its rapprochement with the ritualistic tradition of Hinduism. So it is a later developed ritualistic system with a special kind of meditation, though the *Mantrayana* claims that the *tantras* are as old and authentic as any other teaching of the Buddha. *Introduction to Buddhist Tantric Systems* is a literal translation, with the Tibetan text in transliteration. Regarding this work, the translators are of the opinion that it is neither the chief nor the best work of M. G. Rje. However it is a simple yet an excellent work through which a student can be well introduced into the Tibetan Buddhist Tantric system. It presents a beautiful analysis of the four *tantras* of Tibetan Buddhism such as *Kriya*, *Carya*, *Yoga* and *Anuttara yoga*.

The present work comprises nine chapters. The author begins the book by exposing the doctrinal positions of Sravakas, Mahayana, and of certain schools and scholars on the enlightenment of Buddha. Then he enumerates the essential pre-requisites needed for a student for the study and practice of *tantras*. The next five chapters explain the four Tibetan *tantras* with a detailed analysis of the initiations, vows and other procedures of each of the *Tantras*. Chapters eight and nine deal with the characteristics and kinds of *mandalas*, the method of initiation in the *mandala* and finally, the method of conferring initiation upon the aspirant. This book offers a dependable introduction to the Buddhist *tantric* system.

T. Muppathinchira

Peter Fernando (ed.)

Socio-Pastoral Dimensions of Priestly Formation

Satprakashan Sanchar Kendra, Indore, 1984, pp. 172, Rs. 25/-

The goal of any formation is the development of the entire person. As such, in the formation of the priests, together with the spiritual

aspects, the other dimensions of the person also have to be taken care of. The contributors of this book discuss the importance of the socio-pastoral dimensions and suggest strategies for bettering the formation of priests in the seminaries. Some of the suggestions are along the following lines. MacDonald lays stress on committed action on the part of priests to form the seminaries in the area of socio-economic development. Volken S. J. says that if the priest does not find the Lord in the poor, he may not find Him in the church either. The readiness to 'get into trouble' for the sake of the downtrodden should be the key criterion of a good social formation. Gonsalves reminds us of 'a challenge before us to transform the unjust oppressive social order into a New Heaven and a new earth', and observes that religions, to some extent, have become part of today's oppressive socio-political system. D'Mello sees the priest as no longer the centre of the parish Church but as an animator of any community, trying to unify the different charisms in that community. Miffen shows that sociology is a very useful tool for describing the existence or social inequalities and to understand higher disciplines such as theology and social philosophy. Wilfred feels the need for professors of sociological analysis and theological reasoning to teach the future priests to approach the Bible for answers to present-day questions that affect people and to discover the Word of God in every situation.

Clarence Srambical

A. M. Mundadan

Indian Christians Search for Identity & Struggle for Autonomy

Dharmaram Publications, Bangalore, 1984, pp. 224.

The 20th century is acclaimed for awakening national consciousness throughout the world. The scheduled caste and even the tribal people of our country were being steadily conscientized and were trying for their liberation. Liberation theology is acquiring more and more meaning and popularity. Still it is a pathetic picture that one sees in the Church in India. The author of this work Fr. Mundadan, as himself confesses in the work, is "obsessed with this idea of an Indian Church", and any one who loves his country and the Church will share this "obsession" if he goes through the work. The present

work is actually the Placid Lectures which the author delivered in Rome.

This is not a history of the Indian Church or Churches in India; rather the author takes us on a journey through the centuries showing only the struggle, stress and strain of each Church for asserting its identity and autonomy. Out of the nine chapters the first six were devoted to show the identity and autonomy the Indian Church enjoyed. This was later shattered as a result of the encounter with the Latin Church which had intimate connection with the colonial powers. The author also lucidly analyses how from the middle of the 17th century each section of these shattered communities tried to discover a new identity. Syro-Malabar and Syro-Malankara found this in communion with Rome: the Marthomites in communion with the Anglican-Jacobites in Antioch. But this new identity in a western environment looked awkward and so there were isolated attempts to free the Church from the western clutches. The author points out that it is the Protestants who succeeded much better than the Catholics in becoming conscious of the problem of Indianization. The Latin Church, which is more conscious perhaps of its pure western origin and nature, has, to its credit, earlier attempts at Indianization. In the last chapter the author draws a picture of the national awakening, especially among the Protestant Christians.

The book definitely is a great contribution to the Churches of India. All who aspire for a liberated India should first be conscious of the rich heritage, identity and autonomy of the ancient Church in India. It is perhaps the relentless fight of this Church for centuries against the colonial rulers and its practical success that gave a moral boost to the efforts of the Indian national leaders. This work will definitely help the Christians to become conscious of the need of discovering their identity and autonomy, to strengthen and preserve their national pride.

Andrews Athappilly

Thomas A. Kochumuttom

A Buddhist Doctrine of Experience

(A New Translation and Interpretation of the Works of Vasubandhu the Yogacarin)

Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1982, pp xxiv + 287, Rs. 100/-

Here is a challenging volume for any student of Buddhism. Dr Kochumuttom invites the Buddhist scholars to look at the Yogacara writings in a new perspective. They are traditionally interpreted in terms of monistic idealism. But the present author suggests that they are open to interpretation in terms of pluralistic realism. His contention is that the Yogacara metaphysics is basically the same as that of the early Buddhism. He presents his thesis by giving a new translation and interpretation of the basic works of Vasubandhu the Yogacarin. They are: i) *Madhyantavibhaga-karika-bhasya*, ii) *Trisvabhava-nir desa*, iii) *Trimsatika*, and iv) *Vimsatika*.

The Buddhist doctrine of experience as presented in these works has been summarized by the author as follows: "The experience of *samsara* consists basically in one's being forced to view oneself as the grasper (*grahaka*), the enjoyer (*bhoktr*), the knower (*jnatr*) of all beings, which are then viewed as the graspable (*grahya*), the enjoyable (*bhojya*), the knowable (*jneya*). There one cannot help mentally constructing the distinction between the subject and the object, the grasper and the graspable, the enjoyer and the enjoyable..... Now, therefore, all that an aspirant to buddhahood should be warned against is the idiosyncrasy for the graspable-grasper distinction. That the graspable-grasper distinction is mere imagination of the unreal (*abhuta-parikalpa*), and that, therefore it is non-existent (*na-vidyate*) and illusory (*bhranti*), is repeated time and again" (pp 12-13). Therefore, Dr Kochumuttom argues, what is denied is the subject-object characterization, and not the plurality of beings. The enlightenment, then consists in realizing all things neither as subjects nor as objects, but in their suchness (*tathata*).

The first chapter clearly states the thesis and outlines the main arguments, and thus puts the whole work in perspective. Chapters II-V are translations along with the author's interpretation of the four texts, respectively. The sixth and final chapter is a re-statement and re-examination of the thesis proposed in the beginning. The author feels that the traditional interpreters have wrongly understood certain terms like *vijnapti-matra*, *vijnana-parinama* and *abhuta-parikalpa* as expressions of idealism, while on a deeper analysis they prove to be otherwise. Bringing together all the central concepts and terms, this final chapter provides a complete picture of Vasubandhu's Yogacara system.

Then, the appendix, by giving the translation of all the text at one stretch, facilitates a continuous reading of the texts.

Dr Kochumuttom's "translation is faithful to the original, arguments convincing and consistent, and presentation clear and readable." Moreover, being a radical re-interpretation of the Yogacara system, the book cannot escape the notice of any future research student of Buddhism. Even a historian of religion has to consider the suggestion that "Buddhism, throughout its long history of development, has retained the original inspiration of its founder, the Buddha. The latter believed in a multiplicity of real, individual beings, a belief that has never been seriously questioned by any of his followers. The different stages in the history of Buddhism mark, if anything, the different ways of looking at the same teaching of the Buddha. Consequently, the different schools within Buddhism distinguish from each other not so much in their philosophy as in their practices" (pp xvi-xvii).

Discussing the identity of Vasubandhu the Yogacarin, the author says that he could be the same person as the author of *Abhidharma-kosa*. For, he finds the possibility of "an almost spontaneous transition from *Abhidharma-kosa* to the Yogacara system. For instance, the theory of store-consciousness (*alaya-vijnana*) which is universally recognized as a basic innovation of the Yogacarins, is after all only the 'christening' of the theory of the seeds (*bija*) in the *Abhidharma-kosa*" (p xiii).

The author draws our attention to two interesting points of comparison. First of all, there is the comparison between the Freudian and Yogacara models of psycho-analysis. Vasubandhu has made "a depth analysis of the psyche with a view to identifying the dynamics (such as *samskaras* and *vasanas*) of motivation (*trṣṇa*), which the Buddha had long ago said to be the root cause (*samudayasatya*) of the human malaise (*duhkha*). The factors into which the Yogacarins analysed the psyche are not very different from those suggested in the early Buddhism. It was, however, an original contribution on the part of the Yogacarins that they traced all the psychic variations to the unconscious level called *alaya-vijnana* (store-consciousness), from where given the opportunities they rise to the conscious level called *pravrtti-vijnana* (active consciousness) through the medium of the pre-conscious level called *manana-vijnana* (thinking consciousness.)" (p 222).

Then, the Yogacara "analysis of the psyche led them to the conclusion that what one experiences in the state of *samsara*, is never the thing as such but the forms of subjectivity and objectivity constructed and projected by the psyche. Here one may recall Kant's theory of categories—categories, which he said the mind imposes on the sense-data, and under which alone the latter can be understood" (p 224). Further, referring to the distinction made by Vasubandhu between the ineffable (*anabhilapya*) and the imagined (*parikalpita*) natures of things, the author says that it "seems to have received little attention from those who interpret the Yogacara system as an idealism... The distinction between the ineffable and the imagined natures of things far from sounding idealistic, reminds me of Kant's distinction between phenomena and noumena" (pp 224-5). What is being suggested here is that man in the state of *samsara* experiences things inevitably under the categories of subjectivity and objectivity, while their reality as such (*tathata*) remains beyond the limits of his comprehension. However, unlike Kant, Vasubandhu recognizes a supra-mundane mode of knowledge (*lokottara-jnana*) in which one realizes all things in their suchness.

Thus, with his insightful suggestions Dr Kochumuttom has opened a new line of inquiry in the field of Buddhism, which should be considered the merit of the work.

A.M. Mundadan

Benoytosh Bhattacharya

An Introduction to Buddhist Esoterism

Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 1931, pp. 184, Rs. 75/-

The author has rendered commendable service in bringing to light Tantrism and its influences on the lives of the people at large. To be precise, Buddhist Tantrism is the subject-matter of the scholarly treatment in this work. The origin and growth of Buddhist magic is given a clear and systematic exposition in the book. The author explains how Buddhism as taught by the Buddha underwent many changes and degenerated owing to a variety of circumstances. This degenerated form of Buddhism is called *Vajrayana*, or Tantric Buddhism.

The author spares us effort to give a clear and correct assessment of the Tantras and Tantric culture. According to him it would be utter folly to declare that the Tantras contain nothing but preachings of immorality and all kinds of unmentionable vices. He affirms that the Tantric culture is the greatest of all cultures because it aims at the spiritual perfection and psychic development of man. The author claims that the Tantric culture is the greatest contribution made by India to world culture. This position seems to be highly exaggerated. The author makes it clear that Tantra is not meant for all as it demands high degree of intellectual power. He seems to imply that the degeneration we notice in Tantra could be attributed to its misuse by unworthy men guided wholly by worldly and selfish motives. The author deserves our appreciation for his clear and systematic presentation of Buddhist esoterism.

Joseph Kuttiany

Satkari Mookerjee

The Buddhist Philosophy of Universal Flux

(An Exposition of Philosophy of Critical Realism as Expounded by the School of Dignaga)

Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1980, pp. xvii + 448, Rs. 100/-

Catering to the needs of modern man whose interest in Buddhism is steadily growing since the last few decades, there has been a flood of Buddhist literature in recent years. Many books on Buddhist Philosophy, Psychology and Cosmology have come out both from the East and the West. Even so, as the author of the book observes, a systematic presentation of Dignaga-School of thought was *desideratum*, Prof. Th. Stcherbatsky, in his much celebrated work on Buddhist logic, elaborately discussed the logical tenets of the school. But an exposition of the system as such had not been attempted so far.

Dr. Satkari Mookerjee has filled the gap through his present work. It is an excellent piece which deals with the metaphysical, logical and epistemological doctrines of the school. The expository nature of the work remains despite the author's philosophical and critical approach. He designates the system as critical realism (a position which could be easily challenged) leaving aside the idealistic trends of the school.

Adhering faithfully to the original texts, Mookerjee has presented the philosophy of the system bringing out its strength and purity. A modern mind of European formation will also appreciate the work since Dr. Mookerjee has tried to present it in the language and categories of a modern thinker. As the author claims, he has allowed the philosophers to speak for themselves, a rare phenomenon in the realm of philosophy, which has made the book original and authentic.

The book has been divided into two parts arranged into 26 chapters. Buddhist theory of universal flux with its metaphysical implications and insights are discussed in the first part. The nature of existence, the theory of causation, doctrine of *apoha* and the concept of *Nirvana* have been discussed, making comparisons with other systems. The chapter on negative judgement will be of special interest to a modern man who today is much preoccupied with the negative categories of thought.

Clarity of thought and simplicity of expression have made the work highly readable and intelligible. A historical and philosophical understanding of the different systems of Indian thought is necessary for a fuller appreciation of the book as the author has made a comparative study of the different systems. Even though the comparative study has helped to clarify the Buddhist position, at times it has affected the main concern of the work considerably.

However, it does make a fresh contribution in the field of Buddhist thought. It could be used as a manual and a critical student of Buddhist Philosophy will find it extremely useful especially the epistemological and metaphysical part of it.

Sebastian Kizhakkera

Mohal Lal Sandal

Mimamsa Sutras of Jaimini Vols. 1 + 2

Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1980, pp. ccxi, + 1022, Rs. 200/-

Purva Mimamsa is one of the six systems of Indian Philosophy dealing with the *Karmakanda* section of the Vedas. Many eminent philosophers and scholars have commented on the system and there

are a number of literary works in this field though some of them are still to see the light of the day. The *Mimamsa Sūtras* of Jaimini is the first authoritative work on the Karmakanda whose date is put between 600 and 200 B.C. Mohan Lal Sandal's translation of the *Mimamsa Sūtras* of Jaimini into English adopts a lucid style and simple language. This is a new edition of the *Mimamsa Sūtras*, originally published as Vol. XXVIII of the sacred books of the East, with the addition of word-meanings, translation and notes. Brief commentaries given after every *sūtra* help the reader follow the sequence of the text and clarify the *Mimamsa* philosophy and the principles governing the formulation of the Sūtras. The rather long introduction outlines the system as a whole and summarizes the content of each *pada*. Apart from the literary merits of the book, the author's contribution in clarifying the philosophy of *Purva Mimamsa*, deserves our commendation.

Joseph Pandiyappallil

John C. Holt

Discipline: The Canonical Buddhism of the Vinayapitaka

Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1981, pp. ix, + 157, Rs. 50/-

The book summarizes the discipline of *Vinayapitaka* which is an indispensable means for a Buddhist monk to attain *nibbana*. The originality of the book lies in the author's attempt, and success, in providing new interpretations and insights into rites of Buddhist monastic life. The author deals with the subject in nine chapters. The first chapter indicates the main thrust of and the content of *Vinayapitaka* and analyses the nature and the scope of discipline in it. The discipline advocated by *vinaya* represents a very significant application of the Buddha's *dharmma* (teaching). The discipline and teaching are two inseparable aspects of the soteriological message of the Buddha. "Our conclusion", the author writes, "will address the general Buddhological import of discipline and the originality of the discipline as a means to achieving in the history of man's religions" (p. 16). After giving a short account of the historical context in which Buddhism had its origin the author traces the study of the history and the structure of *Vinayapitaka*. The *vinaya* is said to be "the product of one highly regarded attempt to define membership in that community, a serious reckoning with the central concern of what it means to be a Buddhist."

(p. 30). The analysis ends with the conclusion that discipline is an essential aspect of part or the Buddha's teaching.

The next two chapters explore the conceptual basis of the discipline. The author concludes that the disciplinary code represents the effective behavioural expression leading to the final spiritual goal of religion. Thus the basis of discipline is the belief that it represents an ideal realization of the teachings of *dharma* (pp. 85, 86). As an aspect of discipline *bhikkhusanga* is discussed next. The *Upasampadā* rite of *bhikkhu* discipline symbolically represents the new life obtained through *sangha*-discipline and the world-view realized through the Buddha (p. 124). The author says that the *khandhaka* section of the *vinaya* is essentially concerned with the collective acts of the community, which are ritual expressions, and he interprets these rites as cultic celebrations of discipline (p. 106). Before concluding, the author analyses the significance of *Patimokkha*, *Pavāranā* and *Kathina* rites. He provides original insights gained from his scholarly studies. The work as a whole powerfully and vividly brings out the need of discipline both on the individual and community levels in Buddhism.

Joseph Pandiyappallil

Justin E. Abbot, trans. and ed.

Life of Tukaram

(translation from Mahipati's *Bhaktalilamrita*, chapters 25 to 40)

Motilal Banarsidass, 1980. (Reprint of the first edition, Poona, 1980), pp. xx + 346, Rs. 45/-

Religious India is perhaps better known to the world outside, especially to western scholars, for the *advaitic* tradition of *Sankara*. But what has influenced and continues to influence the masses of India is the *bhakti* tradition. This tradition has probably never been absent from Indian religion at any time. With Ramanuja (late 11 C. A.D.) the firm philosophical foundations for the *bhakti* tradition were laid. The Indian religious mind was instantly fascinated by a personal God, *Iswara*, especially in the context of the *avatara* doctrine and practice—a God who can be loved and worshipped, a God who can be approached with feelings of deep love and personal devotion. The *Bhaga-*

vatgita gave the greatest impetus to the *bhakti* tradition, centred as it is on the personal devotion to Krishna as the *avatar* of Vishnu.

It was the followers of Ramanuja, especially Ramananda, who made *Bhakti* a movement all over India. Tulsidas in the Hindi speaking states, Namdev and Tukaram in Maharashtra, Chaitanya in Bengal, Mirabai on the borders of Gujarat and Rajasthan became great apostles of the movement. It gave rise to an enormous body of literature, poetry and prose.

Jñanesvari, devotional interpretation of *Bhagavatgita* composed (1290 A.D.) by the Marata writer Jnanadev, may be said to have inaugurated the *bhakti* movement in Maharashtra, which continued to flourish during the next four centuries. The movement produced thousands of *bhakti* poets. The lives of these poets were immortalized by their biographers, who were great *bhaktas* themselves. Namdev heads the list of these Marata devotional biographers. Mahipati, (1715-90), one of the last among them, is perhaps the most prolific and most renowned.

The book under review is the English translation of sixteen chapters of Mahipati's *Bhaktalilamritam*. In these chapters, he tells, with devotion and spiritual joy, the inspiring life-story of the great Vaishnavite saint and poet, Tukaram (1598-1651). About Tukaram it is said that "his teacher was no other than the spirit within. God was his centre, his all in all. His words flowed out of a heart full of overflowing love of God and goodwill to men." It is enough to glance through the *Abhangs* (verses) of Tukaram to see how true these words are.

Partly basing himself on the autobiographical references in Tukaram's *Abhangs*, partly on traditional stories and legends, Mahipati used his pious imagination to breathe life into Tukaram's character, conviction and devotion. "The life of Tukaram, as portrayed by Mahipati is full of human interest, full of food for the moralist, full of suggestions for the idealist, and to everyone an inspiration to a better and nobler life." Abbot's rendering (though a little antiquated now) is inspiring and clear, and is helpful to the earnest and serious reader following the path of devotion to emulate Tukaram's sincere and simple style of life. The glossary at the end of the book is very useful and insightful. A modernized version of the book with additional notes and commentaries would be most welcome.

A. M. Mundadan

Austin Flannery, O.P., ed.

Vatican Council II: More Postconciliar Documents (Vatican Collection II)

Grand Rapids, Michigan, W. M. B. Eerdmann Publishing Co., 1982, Pp. xix + 920. No price given.

In 1975 was published under the general editorship of Austin Flannery *Vatican Council II: The Conciliar and Postconciliar Documents*. It contained, besides the sixteen Council documents, a good selection of official documents issued by Rome after the Council was over, extending from 1963 to 1973. These postconciliar documents "might be described as organically linked with the conciliar process."

The present volume is a continuation of the 1975 publication and a companion volume. There are fifty-five additional postconciliar documents in it all of which, except a few, came out during the period between 1972 and 1982. The documents are classified under the same titles as in the first volume. The numbering of articles commences where the previous volume left off.

Austin Flannery, who was for eighteen years involved in the translation and publication of official Church documents, provides a lucid, perceptive translation of significant documents linked with Vatican II. The documents in the present volume are on such subjects as Christian worship, ecumenism, the religious life, ministry, current problems, and education. Not only Catholic Christians, but people of all faiths, who were affected, directly or indirectly, by the spirit and vision of the Second Vatican Council—a great event in the religious history of the 20th century—cannot but profit by reading this volume.

A. M. Mundadan