NOVELTIES IN VOS ESTIS LUX MUNDI 2023

Domy Thomas MSFS*

Abstract

Through this article, the author aims to point out the changes presented in *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 compared with the previous version *Vos estis lux mundi* 2019. After a brief explanation of the purpose of the revision, the two titles of the new document and its modified articles are examined in comparison with the old document, and the changes and novelties in the new document are highlighted.

Keywords: delict, abuse, minors, vulnerable, Dicastery, metropolitan

Introduction

The legislation of the Catholic Church on sexual abuse by the clergy and any other abuse has been subjected to many changes over the centuries. The Catholic Church has always tried to read 'the signs of the time,' and has accordingly been making necessary changes in the legislation in order to respond with positivity to the numerous scandals exposed in various parts of the world. On 7 May 2019, the Supreme Pontiff issued an Apostolic Letter in the form of Motu Proprio titled *Vos estis lux mundi*,¹ and this was later enforced as law with effect from 1 June 2019. On 25 March 2023, the Supreme Pontiff promulgated an updated version of the same Motu Proprio with the same incipit.² It had only a short period of *vocatio legis*. It takes the

^{*} Domy Thomas MSFS holds a Licentiate from St. Peter's Pontifical Institute, Bangalore, and a Doctorate from Pontifical Lateran University, Rome, in Canon Law. He is the Parish Priest of SFS Church, Janakpuri, Delhi and a Judge in the Metropolitan Tribunal of Delhi as well as visiting faculty of Canon Law in *Vidyajyoti* in Delhi, *Morning Star* Seminary in Kolkata, *St. Ephrem's Theological College* in Satna and *Tejas Vidyapeeth* in Bangalore. He also functioned as the interim-Judicial Vicar of the Archdiocese of Delhi from 2022-2023.

¹ Francis, Apostolic Letter issued Motu Proprio *Vos estis lux mundi*, 7 May 2019, in https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/motu_proprio/documents/ papafrancesco-motu-proprio-20190507_vos-estis-lux-mundi.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

 $^{^{2}}$ Francis, Apostolic Letter issued Motu Proprio $\it Vos\,estis\,lux\,mundi$, 25 March 2023, in

force of law on 30 April 2023. With the enforcement of the new Vos estis lux mundi, the previous one promulgated on 7 May 2019 will stand abrogated.3 Like the previous version, the new Vos estis lux *mundi* has an introduction followed by a body of content comprising two titles. The first title deals with general provisions and the second one deals with provisions concerning Bishops and their equivalents both in the Latin Church and in the Oriental Catholic Churches. But unlike the preceding Vos estis lux mundi of 7 May 2019, the revised and updated one of 25 March 2023 has altogether 20 articles, of which the first 5 articles are part of the first title like the previous one, whereas the second title has 15 articles unlike 14 in the earlier version. The previous Vos estis lux mundi had already received a wide range of comments in canonical literature.⁴ Therefore, the objective here is to point out primarily the changes that are presented in Vos estis lux mundi 2023 in comparison to the previous version of Vos estis lux mundi issued in May 2019.

1. Purpose of Revision

As the previous *Vos estis lux mundi*, 2019 was promulgated initially for a period of three years *ad experimentum*, the legislator of the Catholic Church took into consideration the observations and evaluations received from the Bishops' Conferences of different countries besides the Dicasteries of the Roman Curia before the *experimentum* period elapsed in order to assess the experience of these years with the objective of fostering a better application of what had been established without prejudice to the provisions of the Code of Canon Law of the Latin Church and the Code of Canons of the Oriental Churches on penal and procedural matters. Having gone

https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/motu_proprio/documents/202303 25-motu-proprio-vos-estis-lux-mundi-aggiornato.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

³ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, conclusion.

⁴ The author has written a detailed commentary on *Vos estis lux mundi* 2019 in two parts. Part I in *Iustitia* 10/2 (2019) 253-283 and Part II in *Iustitia* 11/1 (2020) 85-111. There are also many other literatures. Some of the examples are B. Daly, "*Vos estis lux mundi*: New Procedures for Dealing with Complaints of Sexual Abuse" in *The Canonist* 10/2 (2019) 144-163; G. Thekkekara, "An overview of the *Vos estis lux mundi*" in *Ephrem's Theological Journal* 23/2 (2019) 150-175; A. Amalraj, "*Vos estis lux mundi*: Procedural Norms on Protecting Minors and Vulnerable Adults" in *Indian Theological Studies* 56 (2019) 307-358; D. G. Astigueta "Lettura di *Vos estis lux mundi*" in *Periodica* 108 (2019) 517-550; J. A. Renken, "*Vos estis lux mundi*. The Evolution of the Church's Response to Sexual Abuse and Its Cover-up After the Vatican Summit," in *Studia canonica* 53 (2019) 627-658.

through an objective assessment, the legislator subsequently promulgated a new, revised, and updated version of the previous *Vos estis lux mundi.*⁵

The intention of the Motu Proprio was not to abrogate or derogate any applicable canons of both the Latin and Oriental Code of Canon Law. Rather, the Pontiff was conscious of Ecclesiastical Laws (the title in CIC and the chapter in CCEO), wherein both the Codes state that in the event of a doubt in law, "the later laws are to be related to the earlier ones and, as far as possible, harmonized with them."6 The intention of the Supreme Pontiff was to favour or foster a better application of the law that was established earlier. This points to a complementary nature of Vos estis lux mundi. Norms regarding delicts reserved to the Dicastery for the Doctrine of Faith (DDF) Sacramentorum sanctitatis tutela were updated through the Rescriptum ex Audientia of Francis on 11 October 2021 and brought into force on 8 December 2021.⁷ Both Codes revised the provisions of sanctions in the Church. The book VI of CIC 1983 Sanctions in the Church was revised and promulgated on 23 May 2021 with the Apostolic Constitution, Pascite gregem Dei, by the Supreme Pontiff Francis.8 In the same way, the penal law of CCEO was revised and promulgated on 20 March 2023 with the Apostolic Constitution Vocare peccatores.9 Subsequently, the new *Vos estis lux mundi* was promulgated after five days. Therefore, harmonizing the new provisions given in both Codes was necessitated in *Vos estis lux mundi* to facilitate better application of the law. The most important novelty in the new Vos estis lux mundi 2023 is that it is no more ad experimentum and that it is expected to

⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Introudction.

⁶ Canons 21 CIC 1983, 1503 CCEO 1990.

⁷ Francis, Rescriptum ex Audientia, 11 October 2021 in https://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/cfaith/documents/rc_con_cfaith_doc_20211011_re scriptum-delittiriservati-cfaith_la.html, on 06/03/2024; Sacramentorum sanctitatis tutela 2021 in https://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/cfaith/documents/rc_con_cfaith_doc_20211011_norme-delittiriservati-cfaith_en.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

⁸ Francis, Apostolic Constitution *Pascite gregem Dei*, 23 May 2021 in https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/apost_constitutions/documents/p apa-francesco_costituzione-ap_20210523_pascite-gregem-dei.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

⁹ Francis, Apostolic Constitution *Vocare peccatores*, 20 March 2023 in https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/la/motu_proprio/documents/202303 20-motu-proprio-vocare-peccatores.html. accessed on 06/03/2024.

remain in force until its revocation any time later by the same authority of the Catholic Church.

2. Novelties in General Provision

Just like the previous *Vos estis lux mundi*, the new one also has two titles, the first dealing with General Provisions and comprising five articles.¹⁰ The structure of the articles remains the same, but there are some modifications in the content.

2.1 Expansion in the Scope of Application

In the first article, there is an expansion in the category of the people to whom the norms given in *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 would apply. As per the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023, the existing norms also apply to the Moderators of the International Association of the Faithful, which is recognized or erected by the Apostolic See.¹¹ The norms in the previous *Vos estis lux* mundi 2019 were applicable only to the clerics or members of the Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life.¹² The inclusion of this category of the lay faithful is one of the important novelties in the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023.

2.2 Offence Against the Sixth Commandment of the Decalogue

As already mentioned, one of the aims of the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 was to harmonize the norms of applicability with the existing ones. So, the wording of the norms has been changed as per the new Book VI of the Code of Canon Law. The old and new versions have the general division of the delicts into two aspects of the offence: a) and b). In the old document, the first aspect a) was sub-divided into three parts: i, ii and iii.¹³ In the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023, however, the first aspect has four parts with the symbols *, * *, * * * and * * * * *.¹⁴ The wordings are changed as per the new revision of Book VI. The three parts specified in the old document are stated as "forcing someone, by violence or threat or through abuse of authority, to perform or submit to sexual acts," ¹⁵ whereas the four parts specified in the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 are stated as "a delict against the sixth commandment of the Decalogue committed through violence or

¹⁰ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Articles 1-5.

¹¹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1 §1.

¹² Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1 §1.

¹³ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1 §1.

¹⁴ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1 §1.

¹⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1§1, a) i.

threat or through abuse of authority, or by forcing someone to perform or submit to sexual acts." 16 The wordings are changed in conformity with changed canon 1395 §3. 17

In the previous old document, the second offence against the sixth commandment of the Decalogue was mentioned as "performing sexual acts with a minor or a vulnerable person."18 However, in the new Vos estis lux mundi 2023, the scope of the terms: "minor" and "vulnerable person" is enlarged with greater clarity to define the second offence unambiguously as "a delict against the sixth commandment of the Decalogue committed with a minor or with a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason or with a vulnerable adult."19 This change, too, is in accordance with the tripartite division given in the new canon 1398 §1, 1°.20 In the new Vos estis lux mundi 2023, the addition we see is "a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason." The term "vulnerable person" has been changed to "vulnerable adult." From this, it is evident that 'vulnerable adults' correspond to the category of the people to whom the Code of Canon Law recognizes the same protection as conceived for "minors" and for a "person who habitually has imperfect use of reason." The rephrasing of the terms: "minor" and "person" mentioned in the old document and specifically mentioning three categories in place of two, the new document of 2023 clearly distinguishes a vulnerable adult from a minor and a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason. The Code avoided using the term "vulnerable subject," and the Dicastery for the Legislative Texts (DLT) gives the reason "as it represents a notion that is not yet well-defined or doctrinally shared in the broad ambit in which canon law is in force. Therefore, the legislator prefers to use a formulation that was broad enough to include various forms of weakness and fragility of the victim."21 It

¹⁶ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1§1, a) *.

 $^{^{17}}$ Canon 1095§ 3 CIC 1983: "A cleric who by force, threats or abuse of his authority commits an offence against the sixth commandment of the Decalogue or forces someone to perform or submit to sexual acts is to be punished with the same penalty as in § 2." The parallel canon in CCEO is 1453 §4.

¹⁸ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1§1, a) ii.

¹⁹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1§1, a) **.

²⁰ Canon 1398 §1, 1° CIC 1983: "commits an offence against the sixth commandment of the Decalogue with a minor or with a person who habitually has an imperfect use of reason or with one to whom the law recognises equal protection;" The parallel canon in CCEO is 1453 §5 1° (*Vocare peccatores* article 16).

²¹ DLT, Penal Sanctions in the Church: User Guide for Book VI of the Code of Canon Law, 159.

should be noted that the Dicastery for the Doctrine of Faith (DDF) on 30 January 2024 clarified vulnerable adults. A vulnerable adult should not be equated with a minor and a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason. "The definition of vulnerable adult integrates broader cases than the competence of the DDF, which remains limited, in addition to minors under the age of eighteen, to those who habitually have an imperfect use of reason. Therefore, other cases outside of these cases are dealt with by the competent Dicasteries." This was, in fact, an affirmation of what was said by the DLT in 2023. The Dicastery clarified that the reserved delicts mentioned in article 6, 1° of *Sacramentorum sanctitatis tutela* concern minors or persons who habitually have an imperfect use of reason. In the case of any other "vulnerable" persons, jurisdiction over the delict is not reserved to DDF, but it is for the Ordinary to act.²³

What was given in the previous document as "the production, exhibition, possession or distribution, including by electronic means, of child pornography"²⁴ is changed to "the immoral acquisition, possession, exhibition or distribution, in any way or by any means, of pornographic images of minors or of persons who habitually have imperfect use of reason."²⁵ The second part of the same sentence of the previous document, "as well as by the recruitment of or inducement of a minor or a vulnerable person to participate in pornographic exhibitions,"²⁶ is changed to "the recruitment or inducement of a minor or of a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason or a vulnerable adult to pose in a pornographic manner or to participate in real or simulated pornographic exhibitions."²⁷ All these changes are made in accordance with the new canon 1398 §1, 3° and 2°.²⁸

²² DDF, *Chiarimento sugli adulti vulnerabili*, 30 January 2024 in https://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/cfaith/documents/rc_ddf_doc_20240130_c hiarimento-adulti-vulnerabili_it.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

²³ DLT, Penal Sanctions in the Church: User Guide for Book VI of the Code of Canon Law, 159.

²⁴ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1§1, a) iii.

²⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1§1, a) ***.

²⁶ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1§1, a) iii.

²⁷ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1§1, a) ****.

²⁸ 1398 §1, 2° "grooms or induces a minor or a person who habitually has an imperfect use of reason or one to whom the law recognizes equal protection to expose himself or herself pornographically or to take part in pornographic exhibitions, whether real or simulated;" 3° "immorally acquires, retains, exhibits or distributes, in whatever manner and by whatever technology, pornographic images of minors or of

2.3 Actions or Omissions Intended to Interfere with or to Avoid Investigations

Article 1 §1 b of the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023, like the previous document, deals with actions or omissions intended to interfere with or avoid civil or ecclesiastical investigations by the persons mentioned in article 6 of the new documents. So that the words "clerics or religious regarding"²⁹ are changed into "against one of the subjects indicated in §1 regarding."³⁰ This change ensures the inclusion of the new category already mentioned in article 1 of the new document.

2.4 Redefining of terms

In the previous document, "minor" was defined as: "any person under the age of eighteen, or who is considered by law to be the equivalent of a minor."31 New Vos estis lux mundi 2023 defines the term: "minor" as: "any person under the age of eighteen; equivalent to a minor is a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason."32 The meaning of both sentences is the same. Because a person who is considered by law to be the equivalent of an infant is a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason.³³ Similarly, by changing the term: "vulnerable person"34 to "vulnerable adult,"35 a clear distinction is made. Minors, too, are vulnerable and defenceless. However, what is meant by vulnerable adults is not minors. As per the new canon, we need to understand that vulnerable adults are those to whom the law recognizes equal protection as conceived for minors.³⁶ vulnerable should not be equated with minors or those who habitually lack the use of reason.³⁷ Also, the objective of child pornography that was stated to be "for primarily sexual purposes" 38 has been rephrased to "for lewd purposes or for profit." 39 Therefore, from a broader

persons who habitually have an imperfect use of reason." The parallel canon in CCEO is 1453 §5 2°-3° (*Vocare peccatores* article 16).

²⁹ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1§1, b).

³⁰ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1§1, b).

³¹ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1§2, a).

³² Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1§2, a).

³³ Canon 99 CIC 1983.

³⁴ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1§2, b).

³⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1§2, b).

^{36 1398 §1, 1°} CIC 1983.

³⁷ DDF, Chiarimento sugli adulti vulnerabili.

³⁸ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 1§2, c).

³⁹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1§2, b).

perspective, the purpose of pornography is either the satisfaction of lust or the lure of monetary profit.

2.5 Offices or Institutions for the Submission of Reports

As the previous law of 2019 had already mandated the establishment of one or more reliable and easily accessible public mechanism for the submission of reports, including those submitted through the institution of a specific ecclesiastical office,40 and as most of the Episcopal Conferences, Synod of Bishops and the dioceses had complied with the requirements, the new Vos estis lux mundi 2023 merely directs the authorities concerned to make necessary provisions for the submission of reports to the ecclesiastic institutions and offices.⁴¹ Evidently, the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023, being conscious of the established mechanism in place, does not mention the need for the Dioceses to inform the Pontifical Representative about the establishment of the systems referred to in the previous document.⁴² However, the new document specifically mentions that "The reports are to be submitted to these ecclesiastic institutions and offices."43 Also, no details are given about who the members of these offices should be. However, each diocese is obliged to establish an office that is easily accessible to the faithful, and it is for the authorities concerned to decide the mechanism of appointment of members. It is also noted that if a cleric commits a delict reserved for the consideration of the offence by the DDF, the procedure mentioned in the Motu Proprio Sacramentorum sanctitatis tutela and the Instruction Vademecum⁴⁴ are to be followed. But if it is not a reserved case, the competent forum should take up the case and proceed as per the law. For the delicts committed by the categories of people mentioned in article 6 of Vos estis lux mundi, the proper procedures to be followed and the Dicastery to which the report is to be forwarded are given in Part II of Vos estis lux mundi.

⁴⁰ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 2§1.

⁴¹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 2§1.

⁴² Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 2§1.

⁴³ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 2§1.

⁴⁴ DDF, *Vademecum* 5 June 2022, in https://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/cfaith/ddf/rc_ddf_doc_20220605_vademecum-casi-abuso-2.0_en.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

2.6 Competent Ordinary to Proceed as per the Law

An important ambiguity is cleared in the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023. As per the previous document, the Ordinary who received the report had to transmit it without delay to the Ordinary of the place where the delict was said to have occurred and to the Ordinary of the person reported, who proceed according to the law provided for the specific case.⁴⁵ Here, two Ordinaries, the Ordinary of the place of the delict and the Ordinary of the accused, were competent according to the law. As there were no specific guidelines in the old document to determine which of the two Ordinaries had the onus of proceeding further in the case concerned. As such, there was an ambiguity as to who was primarily responsible for proceeding further in the matter. This ambiguity is cleared in the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023, which states: "The Ordinary who received the report shall transmit it without delay to the Ordinary of the place where the events are said to have occurred, as well as to the Ordinary of the person reported. Unless otherwise agreed upon by the two Ordinaries, it is the responsibility of the Ordinary of the place where the events are said to have occurred to proceed according to the law provided for the specific case."46 Therefore, as per the present norms, it is primarily the responsibility of the Ordinary of the place where delicts are said to have taken place to proceed as per the law unless both the Ordinaries together decide otherwise. This is in accordance with the competent forum for penal cases given in Canon 1412 CIC and 1078 CCEO.47

2.7 Obligation of Reporting and Those Exempted

Both the new and old versions of *Vos estis lux mundi* are similar in mandating a cleric or member of an Institute of Consecrated Life or a Society of Apostolic Life to report a delict promptly to the local Ordinary where the events are said to have occurred or to another Ordinary among those referred to in canons 134 CIC and 984 CCEO as and when he or she learns, or has well-founded reasons to believe, that one of the acts referred to in article 1 has been committed.⁴⁸

⁴⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 2§3.

⁴⁶ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 2§3.

⁴⁷ Both the canons say: "In penal cases the accused, even if absent, can be brought to trial before the tribunal of the place where the delict was committed" (canon 1412 CIC and 1078 CCEO).

⁴⁸ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 3§1; Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 3§1.

However, the two versions are dissimilar only in the exemptions granted in the mandate. The first exemption mentioned in the revised 2023 version is only for the cleric who learns of the information during the exercise of his ministry in the internal forum.⁴⁹ According to canon 1550, §2, n. 2,⁵⁰ the confessors and anyone who received the knowledge through the Sacrament of Penance in the confessional are exempted from testifying in a related case trial. In comparison, the previous 2019 document exempted all those who were covered under canons 1548 §2 CIC and 1229 §2 CCEO.⁵¹ Hence, the new 2023 document removes any ambiguity by clearly mentioning that the exemption granted in the mandate is only for the internal forum and not applicable to any other obligation of secrecies.⁵²

The second exemption remains the same as in the previous document. It is for the cases established by §3 of this same article. For them, the matter is to be reported to the competent authority referred to in title two of *Vos estis lux mundi* and not to the Ordinary.⁵³ The procedure to be followed, too, is specified in Title II.

The previous document stated: "Any person can submit a report concerning the conduct referred to in article 1, using the methods referred to in the preceding article, or by any other appropriate means." But the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 states: "Any person, in particular the lay faithful who serve in offices or exercise ministries in the Church, can submit a report concerning one of the acts referred to in article 1, using the methods referred to in the preceding article, or by any other appropriate means." The new 2023 document, therefore, specifically mentions that a special obligation is given in particular to the lay faithful who serve in offices or exercise ministries in the Church.

As per the previous and present *Vos estis lux mundi*, if the report is about one of the persons indicated in article 6, it is to be addressed to

⁴⁹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 3§1.

⁵⁰ §2. The following are considered incapable: [...] 2/ priests regarding all matters which they have come to know from sacramental confession even if the penitent seeks their disclosure; moreover, matters heard by anyone and in any way on the occasion of confession cannot be accepted even as an indication of the truth.

⁵¹ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 3§1.

⁵² Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 3§1.

⁵³ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 3§3; Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 3§3.

⁵⁴ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 3§2.

⁵⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 3§2.

the authority identified on the basis of articles 8 and 9. The report can be sent to the competent Dicastery directly or through the Pontifical Representative.⁵⁶ The new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 states that the report shall be addressed to the competent Dicastery and can be sent directly or through the Pontifical Representative. The new document also specifies that if the report is sent directly to the Dicastery, it is obligatory for the Dicastery to inform the Pontifical Representative concerned about the matter.⁵⁷

2.8 Not Bound by the Obligation to Keep Silent

The third paragraph of article 4 of the 2019 document stated: "An obligation to keep silent may not be imposed on any person with regard to the contents of his or her report."58 But the new Vos estis lux mundi 2023 added something more. It states: "An obligation to keep silent may not be imposed on the person claiming to have suffered as a result of a delict or on the witnesses with regard to the contents of their report, without prejudice to the provisions of article 5 §2."59 On 6 December 2019, the Supreme Pontiff, through a rescript, decided to abolish pontifical secrecy in cases of sexual abuse of minors, sexual violence, and child pornography.⁶⁰ In article 5, the document states: "The person who files the report, the person who alleges to have been harmed, and the witnesses shall not be bound by any obligation of silence with regard to matters involving the case."61 Therefore, the persons involved in such cases are not bound by the obligation to keep silent. In the new document, witnesses have also been added.⁶² But as per the provisions of article 5 §2 of Vos estis lux mundi 2023, legitimate protection of good name, confidentiality of personal data, etc., must be safeguarded.63

⁵⁶ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 3§3; Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 3§3.

⁵⁷ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 3§3.

⁵⁸ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 4§3.

⁵⁹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 4§3.

⁶⁰ Rescriptum Ex Audientia SS.MI: Rescript of the Holy Father Francis to promulgate the Instruction on the Confidentiality of Legal Proceedings, 6 December 2019 in https://press.vatican.va/content/salastampa/en/bollettino/pubblico/2019/12/17/191217b.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

⁶¹ Instruction on the Confidentiality of Legal Proceedings, 5.

⁶² Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 4§3.

⁶³ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 5§2.

2.9 Protection of Reputation and Privacy of Victim/Accused

Article 5 §2 of the old 2019 document stated: "The good name and the privacy of the persons involved, as well as the confidentiality of their personal data, shall be protected." The new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 also states unambiguously: "The legitimate protection of the good name and the privacy of all persons involved, as well as the confidentiality of their personal data, must be ensured. To the aforementioned persons, the presumption addressed in article 13 §7 shall apply, without prejudice to the provisions of article 20."65

The 2023 document, therefore, makes it clear that it is obligatory to protect the good name, the privacy of the persons involved, and the confidentiality of their personal data. Both CIC 1983 and CCEO 1990 express the right of the person to protect his/her good reputation and privacy. In certain countries, the dignity and name of persons involved in the cases of the delicts mentioned in this document remain stained forever, and the person ends up suffering physical, mental, and moral damage. Therefore, it is necessary to protect the reputation of all the persons involved. Therefore, the Church authorities must exercise great caution to protect the rights of both the accuser and the accused. Article 13 §7 speaks about the presumption of innocence, and article 20 speaks about the need to comply with the instructions/directives/orders of the civil authorities.

3. Novelties in the Provisions Concerning Bishops and their Equivalents

Title II of the new and the old *Vos estis lux mundi* deals with the standard operating procedure to be followed if the Bishops and their Equivalents are accused of the delicts. Though this title speaks about the implication of Bishops and their equivalents as accused, a close look at the articles of this part will make us realize that it is also about others who can be accused. The following procedures are meant only for the subjects mentioned in article 6 of the document.

3.1 New Group

Another significant novelty of the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 is the inclusion of two new groups of superiors as accused of the delicts/negligence in responding. The first group comprises the

⁶⁴ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 5§2.

⁶⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 5§2.

⁶⁶ Canons 220 CIC 1983; 23 CCEO 1990.

clerics who are or who were leaders of public clerical associations with the faculty of incardination, for acts committed *durante munere*.⁶⁷ The second group comprises lay faithful who are or who were Moderators of International Associations of the Faithful recognized or erected by the Apostolic See for acts committed *durante munere*.⁶⁸ These two groups were not part of the previous 2019 *Vos estis lux mundi*.

3.2 Updating Dicasteries

It should be noted that the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 updates the nomenclature with the word Dicasteries in accordance with the Apostolic Constitution *Praedicate Evangelium*.⁶⁹ Previously, they were called Congregations; therefore, the previous document used the term congregations. In connection with the change in article 6, the following article includes the Dicastery for the Laity, the Family and Life.⁷⁰ This was done because they are competent to recognize and erect the International Associations of the Faithful.⁷¹

3.3 Procedure Applicable

Though the second title is regarding provisions concerning Bishops and their equivalents, it is not only about the bishops and their equivalents in the Code of Canon Law. It is also about specifying equivalent designations and their parity with the established church hierarchy in existence so that there is no void/ambiguity in determining the immediate next higher authority to whom a report can be sent in the event of a delict committed by the Head of ecclesiastical circumscriptions that is subject to the Holy See. That is why one more heading has been added to the title, along with a new article. Article 8 is given the heading "Procedure applicable in the event of a report concerning a Bishop of the Latin Church and other subjects listed in article 6." Article 9 is titled "Procedure applicable to Bishops of Eastern Catholic Churches and other subjects listed in article 6." The entirely new title is "Procedure applicable to Supreme Moderators of Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life."

CIC 1983 mentions the designations that are treated as equivalent to the diocesan Bishops. Canon 368 specifies what is equivalent to a diocese, and

⁶⁷ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 6, d).

⁶⁸ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 6, f).

⁶⁹ Francis, Apostolic Constitution *Praedicate Evangelium*, 19 March 2022 in https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/apost_constitutions/documents/2 0220319-costituzione-ap-praedicate-evangelium.html.

⁷⁰ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 7§1.

⁷¹ Praedicate Evangelium, 134.

canon 381 §2 refers to the designations that are considered equivalent to a diocesan Bishop in law unless the contrary is clear from the nature of things or a provision of law. This is, in fact, equalization of the powers of the Roman Curia, whose individual Dicasteries have direct competence over the heads of the particular Churches, Supreme Moderators of the Institutes of Consecrated Life and the Societies of Apostolic Life as well as the Supreme Moderators of Clerical or Lay Associations. Article 8 §2 contains a new sentence: "The report is likewise forwarded to the Holy See when it concerns those who have pastoral leadership of ecclesiastical circumscriptions immediately subject to the Holy See."72 Thus, the new document covers a void that was left in the previous document about to whom the report should be sent if the head of ecclesiastical circumscriptions commits the delict and is immediately subject to the Holy See. Similarly, the role of the proper Dicastery is emphasized, and article 9 clarifies that the competent Dicastery for the Bishops of the Oriental Churches is the Dicastery for the Eastern Churches.⁷³ In the same 2023 document, article §4 adds a new clause: "If the Dicastery deems it appropriate, informs the Patriarch, Major Archbishop or the competent Metropolitan *sui iuris*,"⁷⁴ this was not there in the previous document.

Article 10 is entirely a new addition. It says: "If the report concerns those who are or who were Supreme Moderators of Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life of Pontifical Right, including monasteries *sui iuris* in Rome or in the suburbicarian Dioceses, it is forwarded to the competent Dicastery." 75

3.4 Initial Duties of the Metropolitan

In the previous document, article 10 dwelt on the initial duties of the metropolitan. The Because of the inclusion of the new article with the heading "Procedure applicable to Supreme Moderators of Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life" in the new document, the initial duties of metropolitan is given in article 11. While the previous document had only two paragraphs, the new *Vos*

⁷² Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 8§2.

⁷³ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 9§3.

⁷⁴ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 9§4.

⁷⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 10.

⁷⁶ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 10.

⁷⁷ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 9§6: The following provisions relating to the Metropolitan apply to the ecclesiastical authority to which the report is to be forwarded based on article 9.

estis lux mundi 2023 contains three paragraphs.⁷⁸ The innovation is found in the third paragraph. "If the Metropolitan considers the report manifestly unfounded, he shall inform the competent Dicastery through the Pontifical Representative, and unless otherwise instructed by the Dicastery, will archive the report." ⁷⁹ As per the previous document, "unless the report is manifestly unfounded, the Metropolitan immediately requests, from the competent Dicastery, that he be assigned to commence the investigation. If the Metropolitan considers the report manifestly unfounded, he shall so inform the Pontifical Representative." In the new document, the Metropolitan is duty-bound to inform the Dicastery without delay, even if the report is manifestly unfounded. The Metropolitan is, therefore, mandated to follow the instructions given by the Dicastery as to whether the investigation should be closed/archived or not.

3.5 Entrusting the Investigation to a person other than the Metropolitan

In the previous 2019 document, there was no mention of the need for the competent Dicastery to consult the Pontifical Representative before deciding whether it would be appropriate to entrust the enquiry to a person other than the Metropolitan The Dicastery had only to inform the Metropolitan about the enquiry being held.⁸⁰ But as per the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023, it was mandatory for the Dicastery to consult the Pontifical Representative⁸¹ before entrusting an investigation to a person other than the Metropolitan.

3.6 Safeguarding Reputation and Presumption of Innocence

Protection of good name is already mentioned in article 5 §2 of the 2019 document. Article 13 §7 of the 2023 document states: "The person under investigation always enjoys the presumption of innocence and the legitimate protection of his or her good name." ⁸² In the previous document, the parallel article spoke only about the presumption of innocence. ⁸³ The same article in its §1 d) makes it necessary to protect the reputation of the persons while requesting information from individuals and institutions, including civil institutions, as relevant

⁷⁸ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 11.

⁷⁹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 11§3.

⁸⁰ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 11§1.

⁸¹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 12§1.

⁸² Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 17§7.

⁸³ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 12§7.

inputs for the inquiry.⁸⁴ All these reflect the emphasis given to protecting a person's good name, which is his or her right as per the laws of the Church.

3.7 Conflict of Interest

The previous 2019 document required the metropolitan to be impartial and free from any conflict of interest. If the Metropolitan found himself in a conflict of interest or could not act impartially to ensure the integrity of the investigation, he was obliged to recuse himself from the investigation and report the circumstance to the competent Dicastery.⁸⁵ The new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 adds something more. It says: "Likewise, anyone who believes there is a conflict of interest in the case is required to inform the competent Dicastery."⁸⁶ Therefore, it is incumbent upon anyone who finds that there is a conflict of interest concerning an investigator, he or she is bound to inform the competent Dicastery about the matter.

3.8 Changes in Time Limits

Earlier, as per requirements of the 2019 document, the Metropolitan was asked to send a status report on the investigation to the competent Dicastery every thirty days.⁸⁷ But in the new *Vos estis lux mundi* of 2023, the Metropolitan was required to send the status report periodically as instructed by the competent Dicastery. The new law states: "in accordance with the instructions received, the Metropolitan periodically sends a status report on the state of the investigation to the competent Dicastery."⁸⁸ This change in the requirement ensures that there are no unwarranted delays in the process of investigation while also expediting the delivery of justice.

According to the 2019 document, the investigations were to be completed within a fixed period of ninety days or within any other time frame otherwise set by the Dicastery.⁸⁹ However, the revised document of 2023 lays down a more realistic time frame by leaving it to the competent Dicastery to stipulate the time period for completion of the investigation and submission of the report.⁹⁰ The new

⁸⁴ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 13§1 d).

⁸⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 12§6.

⁸⁶ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 13§6.

⁸⁷ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 12§9.

⁸⁸ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 1389.

⁸⁹ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 14§1.

⁹⁰ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 15§1.

document also allows an extension of time for the completion of the investigation provided a status report is submitted well in time to the competent Dicastery before seeking the extension.⁹¹

3.9 Precautionary Measure

Depending upon the facts or circumstances of the case concerned, the 2019 document enabled the Metropolitan to propose to the competent Dicastery the need for taking appropriate precautionary measures with respect to the accused person. ⁹² Concerning such issues, the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023, however, stipulates that the Dicastery shall allow implementation of such measures ⁹³ as given in the provisions only after having first consulted the Pontifical Representative in the matter concerned.

3.10 Transmission of the Acts

As per the new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023, once the investigation is completed, the original version of the acts is to be transmitted to the competent Dicastery along with the *votum* of the metropolitan. The new law also demands a copy of the acts to be kept in the archive of the competent Pontifical Representative.⁹⁴ The earlier *Vos estis lux mundi* did not specify that the original version was to be sent. Also, the need to keep a copy of the acts with the Pontifical Representative was not there in the previous version.⁹⁵

3.11 Obligation to Notify the Results

Previously, the outcome of the investigation was to be informed upon request by the person who has alleged the offense that was investigated or by the legal representatives of the complainant in compliance with the instructions of the competent Dicastery. The new *Vos estis lux mundi* 2023 extends this obligation also to the person(s) who reported the delict for investigation or their legal representatives. This is very important from the point of view of the faithful's right to information.

⁹¹ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 15§1.

⁹² Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 15.

⁹³ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 16.

⁹⁴ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 18§1.

⁹⁵ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 17§1.

⁹⁶ Vos estis lux mundi 2019, Article 17§3.

⁹⁷ Vos estis lux mundi 2023, Article 18§3.

Conclusion

The newness in the revised Vos estis lux mundi 2023 is sufficiently evident in the several changes that have been brought in through clarifications and amending additions to overcome the inherent limitations of the previous version of 2019. The most significant change is that the new document no longer has ad experimentum. It has a permanent existence in the legislations of the Catholic Church, and it will remain in force of law until the Supreme Authority of the Church decides otherwise. The revised Vos estis lux mundi 2023 harmonizes and complements the provisions and scope of the law with other existing and updated laws. The rephrasing and additions in the content of the document have brought in an abundance of clarity, leaving no scope for any ambiguity in its interpretation. The new version clarifies many things, for instance, the distinction between a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason and a vulnerable adult, the primary responsibility of the Ordinary of the place where a delict is said to have taken place, the concern for the protection of the good reputation of all the persons concerned in the context of a delict, and the need for maintaining the inbuilt confidentiality of the internal forum. The new Vos estis lux mundi 2023 also provides clear guidelines to ensure standard operating procedure while dealing with matters concerning a delict so that transparency and fairness of the investigating process become evident and the role of the Pontifical Representative in the process serves its purpose. Another new addition in the 2023 document is the inclusion of new categories, that is, the heads of the International Associations of the Faithful, as well as the heads of those who have the power to incardinate clerics, so order that they too are made responsible and accountable for their acts of commission and omission in matters of the delicts referred to in the document. The new Vos estis lux mundi 2023 is intended to be an immensely welcome document that makes known to everyone the desired acceptable norms of the Catholic Church for probing sexual and other abuses in general and particularly those committed by its authorities while also ensuring justice and protection for the weakest and defenceless anywhere in the world. Its success will depend on the quality and quantum of trust and cooperation of all concerned in the collective wisdom and sanctity of the institution of the Catholic Church.

APPENDIX Comparative Table of *Vos estis lux mundi*2019 and 2023

Vos estis lux mundi 2023 ⁹⁸	Vos estis lux mundi 2019 ⁹⁹
APOSTOLIC LETTER ISSUED MOTU PROPRIO	APOSTOLIC LETTER ISSUED MOTU PROPRIO
BY THE SUPREME PONTIFF FRANCIS	BY THE SUPREME PONTIFF FRANCIS
"VOS ESTIS LUX MUNDI"	"VOS ESTIS LUX MUNDI"

"You are the light of the world. A city set on a hill cannot be hidden" (*Mt* 5:14). Our Lord Jesus Christ calls every believer to be a shining example of virtue, integrity and holiness. All of us, in fact, are called to give concrete witness of faith in Christ in our lives and, in particular, in our relationship with others.

The crimes of sexual abuse offend Our Lord, cause physical, psychological and spiritual damage to the victims and harm the community of the faithful. In order that these phenomena, in all their forms, never happen again, a continuous and profound conversion of hearts is needed, attested by concrete and effective actions that involve everyone in the Church, so that personal sanctity and moral commitment can

"You are the light of the world. A city set on a hill cannot be hidden" (Mt 5:14). Our Lord Jesus Christ calls every believer to be a shining example of virtue, integrity and holiness. All of us, in fact, are called to give concrete witness of faith in Christ in our lives and, in particular, in our relationship with others.

The crimes of sexual abuse offend Our Lord, cause physical, psychological and spiritual damage to the victims and harm the community of the faithful. In order that these phenomena, in all their forms, never happen again, a continuous and profound conversion of hearts is needed, attested by concrete and effective actions that involve everyone in the Church, so that personal sanctity and moral commitment can contribute to promoting the

⁹⁸ Francis, Apostolic Letter issued Motu Proprio Vos estis lux mundi, 25 March 2023, https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/motu_proprio/documents /20230325-motu-proprio-vos-estis-lux-mundi-aggiornato.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

⁹⁹ Francis, Apostolic Letter issued Motu Proprio *Vos estis lux mundi*, 7 May 2019, https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/motu_proprio/documents/papa-francesco-motu-proprio-20190507_vos-estis-lux-mundi.html, accessed on 06/03/2024.

contribute to promoting the full credibility of the Gospel message and the effectiveness of the Church's mission. This becomes possible only with the grace of the Holy Spirit poured into our hearts, as we must always keep in mind the words of Jesus: "Apart from me you can do nothing" (*Jn* 15:5). Even if so much has already been accomplished, we must continue to learn from the bitter lessons of the past, looking with hope towards the future.

This responsibility falls, above all, on the successors of the Apostles, chosen by God to be pastoral leaders of his People, and demands from them a commitment to follow closely the path of the Divine Master. Because of their ministry, in fact, Bishops, "as vicars and legates of Christ, govern the particular churches entrusted to them by their counsel, exhortations, example, and even by their authority and sacred power, which indeed they use only for the edification of their flock in truth and holiness, remembering that he who is greater should become as the lesser and he who is the chief become as the servant" (Second Vatican Council, Dogmatic Constitution Lumen Gentium, 27). What more closely concerns the successors of the Apostles concerns all those who, in various ways, assume ministries in the Church, or profess the evangelical counsels, or are called to serve the Christian People. Therefore, it is good that procedures be universally adopted

full credibility of the Gospel message and the effectiveness of the Church's mission. This becomes possible only with the grace of the Holy Spirit poured into our hearts, as we must always keep in mind the words of Jesus: "Apart from me you can do nothing" (Jn 15:5). Even if so much has already been accomplished, we must continue to learn from the bitter lessons of the past, looking with hope towards the future.

This responsibility falls, above all, on the successors of the Apostles, chosen by God to be pastoral leaders of his People, and demands from them a commitment to follow closely the path of the Divine Master. Because of their ministry, in fact, Bishops, "as vicars and legates of Christ, govern the particular churches entrusted to them by their counsel, exhortations, example, and even by their authority and sacred power, which indeed they use only for the edification of their flock in truth and holiness, remembering that he who is greater should become as the lesser and he who is the chief become as the servant" (Second Vatican Council, Dogmatic Constitution Lumen Gentium, 27). What more closely concerns the successors of the Apostles concerns all those who, in various ways, assume ministries in the Church, or profess the evangelical counsels, or are called to serve the Christian People. Therefore, it is good that

to prevent and combat these crimes that betray the trust of the faithful.

In this regard, I promulgated an Apostolic Letter issued Motu Proprio on 7 May 2019 containing norms *ad experimentum* for three years.

Now that this period has passed, taking into consideration the observations of the Episcopal Conferences and the Dicasteries of the Roman Curia, having evaluated the experience of these past years, and in order to facilitate an improved application of what has been established, without prejudice to the penal and procedural provisions set forth in the Code of Canon Law and the Code of Canons of the Eastern Churches, I decree:

procedures be universally adopted to prevent and combat these crimes that betray the trust of the faithful.

I desire that this commitment be implemented in a fully ecclesial manner, so that it may express the communion that keeps us united, in mutual listening and open to the contributions of those who care deeply about this process of conversion.

Therefore, I decree:

TITLE I GENERAL PROVISIONS

Art. 1 - Scope of application

- §1. These norms apply to reports regarding clerics or members of Institutes of Consecrated Life or Societies of Apostolic Life and Moderators of international associations of the faithful recognized or erected by the Apostolic See concerning:
- a)
- * a delict against the sixth commandment of the Decalogue committed through violence or threat or through abuse of

TITLE I GENERAL PROVISIONS

Art. 1 - Scope of application

- §1. These norms apply to reports regarding clerics or members of Institutes of Consecrated Life or Societies of Apostolic Life and concerning:
- a) delicts against the sixth commandment of the Decalogue consisting of:
- i. forcing someone, by violence or threat or through abuse of authority, to perform or submit to sexual acts;

authority, or by forcing someone to perform or submit to sexual acts;

- ** a delict against the sixth commandment of the Decalogue committed with a minor or with a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason or with a vulnerable adult:
- *** the immoral acquisition, possession, exhibition or distribution, in any way or by any means, of pornographic images of minors or of persons who habitually have imperfect use of reason;
- **** the recruitment or inducement of a minor or of a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason or of a vulnerable adult to pose in a pornographic manner or to participate in real or simulated pornographic exhibitions;
- b) conduct carried out by the subjects referred to in art. 6, consisting of actions or omissions intended to interfere with or avoid civil investigations or canonical investigations, whether administrative or penal, against one of the subjects indicated in §1 regarding the delicts referred to in letter a) of this paragraph.
- §2. For the purposes of these norms,
- a) "minor": means any person under the age of eighteen; equivalent to a minor is a person who habitually has imperfect use of reason;

- ii. performing sexual acts with a minor or a vulnerable person;
- iii. the production, exhibition, possession or distribution, including by electronic means, of child pornography, as well as by the recruitment of or inducement of a minor or a vulnerable person to participate in pornographic exhibitions;

- b) conduct carried out by the subjects referred to in article 6, consisting of actions or omissions intended to interfere with or avoid civil investigations or canonical investigations, whether administrative or penal, against a cleric or a religious regarding the delicts referred to in letter a) of this paragraph.
- §2. For the purposes of these norms,
- a) "minor" means: any person under the age of eighteen, or who is considered by law to be the equivalent of a minor;

- b) "vulnerable adult": means any person in a state of infirmity, physical or mental deficiency, or deprivation of personal liberty which, in fact, even occasionally, limits their ability to understand or to want or otherwise resist the offence:
- c) "child pornography": means any representation of a minor, regardless of the means used, involved in explicit sexual activities, whether real or simulated, and any representation of sexual organs of minors for lewd purposes or for profit.

Art. 2 – Reception of reports and data protection

- §1. Taking into account the provisions that may be adopted by the respective Episcopal Conferences, by the Synods of the Bishops of the Patriarchal Churches and the Major Archiepiscopal Churches, or by the Councils of Hierarchs of the Metropolitan Churches sui iuris, the Dioceses or the Eparchies, individually or together, must provide for institutions or offices that are easily accessible to the public for the submission of reports. The reports are to be submitted to these ecclesial institutions and offices.
- §2. The information referred to in this article is protected and treated in such a way as to guarantee its safety, integrity and confidentiality

- b) "vulnerable person" means: any person in a state of infirmity, physical or mental deficiency, or deprivation of personal liberty which, in fact, even occasionally, limits their ability to understand or to want or otherwise resist the offence:
- c) "child pornography" means: any representation of a minor, regardless of the means used, involved in explicit sexual activities, whether real or simulated, and any representation of sexual organs of minors for primarily sexual purposes.

Art. 2 – Reception of reports and data protection

- §1. Taking into account the provisions that may be adopted by the respective Episcopal Conferences, by the Synods of the Bishops of the Patriarchal Churches and the Major Archiepiscopal Churches, or by the Councils of Hierarchs of the Metropolitan Churches sui iuris, the Dioceses or the Eparchies, individually or together, must establish within a year from the entry into force of these norms, one or more public, stable and easily accessible systems for submission of reports, even through the institution of a specific ecclesiastical office. The Dioceses and the Eparchies shall inform the Pontifical Representative of the establishment of the systems referred to in this paragraph.
- §2. The information referred to in this article is protected and treated in such a way as to guarantee its safety, integrity and

pursuant to canons 471, 2° CIC and 244 §2, 2° CCEO.

- §3. Except as provided for by art. 3 §3, the Ordinary who received the report shall transmit it without delay to the Ordinary of the place where the events are said to have occurred, as well as to the Ordinary of the person reported. Unless otherwise agreed upon by the two Ordinaries, it is the responsibility of the Ordinary of the place where the events are said to have occurred to proceed according to the law provided for the specific case.
- §4. For the purposes of this title, Eparchies are equated with Dioceses and the Hierarch is equated with the Ordinary.

Art. 3 - Reporting

- §1. Except for when a cleric learns of information during the exercise of ministry in the internal forum, whenever a cleric or a member of an Institute of Consecrated Life or of a Society of Apostolic Life learns, or has well-founded motives to believe, that one of the acts referred to in art. 1 has been committed, that person is obliged to report it promptly to the local Ordinary where the events are said to have occurred or to another Ordinary among those referred to in canons 134 CIC and 984 CCEO, except for what is established by §3 of the present article.
- §2. Any person, in particular the lay faithful who serve in offices or exercise ministries in the Church,

confidentiality pursuant to canons 471, 2° CIC and 244 §2, 2° CCEO.

§3. Except as provided for by article 3 §3, the Ordinary who received the report shall transmit it without delay to the Ordinary of the place where the events are said to have occurred, as well as to the Ordinary of the person reported, who proceed according to the law provided for the specific case.

§4. For the purposes of this title, Eparchies are equated with Dioceses and the Hierarch is equated with the Ordinary.

Art. 3 - Reporting

- §1. Except as provided for by canons 1548 §2 CIC and 1229 §2 CCEO, whenever a cleric or a member of an Institute of Consecrated Life or of a Society of Apostolic Life has notice of, or well-founded motives to believe that, one of the facts referred to in article 1 has been committed, that person is obliged to report promptly the fact to the local Ordinary where the events are said to have occurred or to another Ordinary among those referred to in canons 134 CIC and 984 CCEO, except for what is established by §3 of the present article.
- §2. Any person can submit a report concerning the conduct referred to in article 1, using the

can submit a report concerning one of the acts referred to in art. 1, using the methods referred to in the preceding article, or by any other appropriate means.

- §3. When the report concerns one of the persons indicated in art. 6, it is to be addressed to the authority identified on the basis of articles 8 and 9. The report can always be sent to the **competent Dicastery** directly or through the Pontifical Representative. If the first option is chosen, the Dicastery will inform the Pontifical Representative about the matter.
- §4. The report **must** include as many particulars as possible, such as indications of time and place of the facts, of the persons involved or informed, as well as any other circumstance that may be useful in order to ensure an accurate assessment of the facts.
- §5. Information can also be acquired *ex officio*.

Art. 4 - Protection of the person submitting the report

- §1. Making a report pursuant to article 3 shall not constitute a violation of office confidentiality.
- §2. Except as provided for by canons 1390 CIC and 1452 and 1454 CCEO, prejudice, retaliation or discrimination as a consequence of having submitted a report is prohibited and may constitute the conduct referred to in article 1 §1, letter b).
- §3. An obligation to keep silent may not be imposed **on the person**

methods referred to in the preceding article, or by any other appropriate means.

- §3. When the report concerns one of the persons indicated in article 6, it is to be addressed to the authority identified based upon articles 8 and 9. The report can always be sent to the *Holy See* directly or through the Pontifical Representative.
- §4. The report *shall* include as many particulars as possible, such as indications of time and place of the facts, of the persons involved or informed, as well as any other circumstance that may be useful in order to ensure an accurate assessment of the facts.
- §5. Information can also be acquired *ex officio*.

Art. 4 – Protection of the person submitting the report

- §1. Making a report pursuant to article 3 shall not constitute a violation of office confidentiality.
- §2. Except as provided for by canons 1390 CIC and 1452 and 1454 CCEO, prejudice, retaliation or discrimination as a consequence of having submitted a report is prohibited and may constitute the conduct referred to in article 1 §1, letter b).
- §3. An obligation to keep silent may not be imposed on any

The procedural norms referred to

in this title concern the delicts

claiming to have suffered as a person with regard to the result of a delict or on the contents of his or her report. witnesses with regard to the contents of their report, without prejudice to the provisions of article 5 §2. Art. 5 - Care for persons Art. 5 - Care for persons §1. The ecclesiastical Authorities §1. The ecclesiastical Authorities shall commit themselves to shall commit themselves to ensuring that those who state that ensuring that those who state that they have been harmed, together they have been harmed, together with their families, are to be treated with their families, are to be with dignity and respect, and, in treated with dignity and respect, particular, are to be: and, in particular, are to be: a) welcomed, listened to and a) welcomed, listened to and supported, including through supported, including through provision of specific services; provision of specific services; b) offered spiritual assistance; b) offered spiritual assistance; c) offered medical assistance, c) offered medical assistance, including therapeutic and including therapeutic and psychological assistance, as psychological assistance, as required by the specific case. required by the specific case. §2. The legitimate protection of §2. The good name and the the good name and the privacy of privacy of the persons involved, all persons involved, as well as the as well as the confidentiality of confidentiality of their personal their personal data, shall be data, must be ensured. To the protected. aforementioned persons the presumption addressed in article 13 §7 shall apply, without prejudice to the provisions of article 20. TITLE II TITLE II PROVISIONS CONCERNING PROVISIONS CONCERNING **BISHOPS BISHOPS** AND THEIR EQUIVALENTS AND THEIR EQUIVALENTS Art. 6 - Subjective scope of Art. 6 - Subjective scope of application application

The procedural norms referred to

in this title concern the conduct

referred to in article 1, carried out by:

- a) Cardinals, Patriarchs, Bishops and Legates of the Roman Pontiff;
- b) clerics who are, or who have been, the pastoral heads of a particular Church or of an entity assimilated to it, Latin or Oriental, including the Personal Ordinariates, for acts committed durante munere:
- c) clerics who are or who were entrusted with the pastoral leadership of a Personal Prelature, for acts committed *durante munere*;
- d) clerics who are or who were leaders of public clerical associations with the faculty of incardination, for acts committed durante munere;
- e) those who are or who were Supreme Moderators of Institutes of Consecrated Life or of Societies of Apostolic Life of Pontifical right, as well as of monasteries *sui iuris*, for acts committed *durante munere*.
- f) lay faithful who are or who were Moderators of international associations of the faithful recognized or erected by the Apostolic See, for acts committed durante munere.

- referred to in article 1, carried out by:
- a) Cardinals, Patriarchs, Bishops and Legates of the Roman Pontiff;
- b) clerics who are, or who have been, the pastoral heads of a particular Church or of an entity assimilated to it, Latin or Oriental, including the Personal Ordinariates, for the acts committed durante munere:
- c) clerics who are or who have been in the past leaders of a Personal Prelature, for the acts committed *durante munere*;
- d) those who are, or who have been, supreme moderators of Institutes of Consecrated Life or of Societies of Apostolic Life of Pontifical right, as well as of monasteries *sui iuris*, with respect to the acts committed *durante munere*.

Art. 7 - Competent Dicastery

§1. For the purposes of this title, "competent Dicastery" means the **Dicastery** for the Doctrine of the Faith, regarding the delicts reserved to it by the norms in force, as well as in all other cases and as far as their respective jurisdiction is

Art. 7 - Competent Dicastery

§1. For the purposes of this title, "competent Dicastery" means the *Congregation* for the Doctrine of the Faith, regarding the delicts reserved to it by the norms in force, as well as, in all other cases and as far as their respective jurisdiction is concerned, based

concerned based on the proper law of the Roman Curia:

- the **Dicastery** for the **Eastern** Churches;
- the Dicastery for Bishops;
- the Dicastery for Evangelization;
- the Dicastery for the Clergy;
- the **Dicastery** for Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life.
- the Dicastery for the Laity, the Family and Life.
- §2. In order to ensure the best coordination, the competent Dicastery informs the Secretariat of State, and the other Dicasteries directly concerned, of the report and the outcome of the investigation.
- §3. The communications referred to in this title between the Metropolitan and the Holy See take place through the Pontifical Representative.
- Art. 8 Procedure applicable in the event of a report concerning a Bishop of the Latin Church and other subjects listed in article 6
- §1. The authority that receives a report transmits it both to the **competent Dicastery** and to the Metropolitan of the Ecclesiastical Province where the person reported is domiciled.
- §2. If the report concerns the Metropolitan, or the Metropolitan See is vacant, it shall be forwarded

- on the proper law of the Roman Curia:
- the *Congregation* for the *Oriental* Churches;
- the Congregation for Bishops;
- the *Congregation* for the Evangelization *of Peoples*;
- the Congregation for the Clergy;
- the *Congregation* for Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life.
- §2. In order to ensure the best coordination, the competent Dicastery informs the Secretariat of State, and the other Dicasteries directly concerned, of the report and the outcome of the investigation.
- §3. The communications referred to in this title between the Metropolitan and the Holy See take place through the Pontifical Representative.
- Art. 8 Procedure applicable in the event of a report concerning a Bishop of the Latin Church
- §1. The authority that receives a report transmits it both to the *Holy See* and to the Metropolitan of the Ecclesiastical Province where the person reported is domiciled.
- §2. If the report concerns the Metropolitan, or the Metropolitan See is vacant, it shall be

to the Holy See, as well as to the suffragan Bishop who is senior by promotion, to whom, if such is the case, the following provisions regarding the Metropolitan apply. The report is likewise forwarded to the Holy See when it concerns those who have pastoral leadership of ecclesiastical circumscriptions immediately subject to the Holy See.

forwarded to the Holy See, as well as to the senior suffragan Bishop by promotion, to whom, if such is the case, the following provisions regarding the Metropolitan apply.

§3. In the event that the report concerns a Papal Legate, it shall be transmitted directly to the Secretariat of State.

§3. In the event that the report concerns a Papal Legate, it shall be transmitted directly to the Secretariat of State.

Art. 9 – Procedure applicable to Bishops of Eastern Catholic Churches and other subjects listed in article 6

Art. 9 – Procedure applicable to Bishops of Eastern Catholic Churches

- §1. Reports concerning a Bishop, or an equivalent subject, of a Patriarchal Church, Major Archiepiscopal or Metropolitan Church *sui iuris* shall be forwarded to the respective Patriarch, Major Archbishop or Metropolitan of the Church *sui iuris*.
- §1. Reports concerning a Bishop of a Patriarchal, Major Archiepiscopal or Metropolitan Church *sui iuris* shall be forwarded to the respective Patriarch, Major Archbishop or Metropolitan of the Church *sui iuris*.
- §2. If the report concerns a Metropolitan of a Patriarchal or Major Archiepiscopal Church, who exercises his office within the territory of these Churches, it is forwarded to the respective Patriarch or Major Archbishop.
- §2. If the report concerns a Metropolitan of a Patriarchal or Major Archiepiscopal Church, who exercises his office within the territory of these Churches, it is forwarded to the respective Patriarch or Major Archbishop.
- §3. In the preceding cases, the authority who receives the report shall also forward it to the **Dicastery for the Eastern** Churches.
- §3. In the preceding cases, the authority who receives the report shall also forward it to the *Holy See*.
- §4. If the person reported is a Bishop or a Metropolitan outside the territory of the Patriarchal, the
- §4. If the person reported is a Bishop or a Metropolitan outside the territory of the Patriarchal, the

Major Archiepiscopal or the Metropolitan Church *sui iuris*, the report shall be forwarded to the Dicastery for the Eastern Churches which, if the Dicastery deems it appropriate, informs the Patriarch, Major Archbishop or the competent Metropolitan *sui iuris*.

Major Archiepiscopal or the Metropolitan Church *sui iuris*, the report shall be forwarded to the *Holy See*.

§5. If the report concerns a Patriarch, a Major Archbishop, a Metropolitan of a Church *sui iuris* or a Bishop of the other Eastern Catholic Churches *sui iuris*, it shall be forwarded to the **Dicastery for the Eastern Churches.**

§5. In the event that the report concerns a Patriarch, a Major Archbishop, a Metropolitan of a Church *sui iuris* or a Bishop of the other Eastern Catholic Churches *sui iuris*, it shall be forwarded to the *Holy See*.

§ 6. The following provisions relating to the Metropolitan apply to the ecclesiastical authority to which the report is to be forwarded based on this article.

§ 6. The following provisions relating to the Metropolitan apply to the ecclesiastical authority to which the report is to be forwarded based on this article.

Art. 10 - Procedure applicable to Supreme Moderators of Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life

If the report concerns those who are or who were Supreme Moderators of Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life of Pontifical right, including monasteries *sui iuris* in Rome or in the suburbicarian Dioceses, it is forwarded to the competent Dicastery.

Art. 11 – Initial duties of the Metropolitan

§1. The Metropolitan **who receives** the report immediately requests that he be appointed by the competent Dicastery to begin the investigation.

Art. 10 – Initial duties of the Metropolitan

§1. Unless the report is manifestly unfounded, the Metropolitan immediately requests, from the competent Dicastery, that he be assigned to commence the investigation. *If the Metropolitan*

- §2. The Dicastery shall **promptly** provide, within thirty days from the receipt of the first report by the Pontifical Representative or the request for the appointment by the Metropolitan, the appropriate instructions on how to proceed in the specific case.
- §3. If the Metropolitan considers the report manifestly unfounded, he shall **inform the competent Dicastery through** the Pontifical Representative, **and unless otherwise instructed by the Dicastery, will archive the report.**

considers the report manifestly unfounded, he shall so inform the Pontifical Representative.

§2. The Dicastery shall *proceed* without delay, and in any case within thirty days from the receipt of the first report by the Pontifical Representative or the request for the assignment by the Metropolitan, providing the appropriate instructions on how to proceed in the specific case.

Art. 12 – Entrusting the investigation to a person other than the Metropolitan

§1. If the competent Dicastery, after consulting the Pontifical Representative, considers it appropriate to entrust the investigation to a person other than the Metropolitan, the Metropolitan is so informed. The Metropolitan delivers all relevant information and documents to the person appointed by the Dicastery.

§2. In the case referred to in the previous paragraph, the following provisions concerning the Metropolitan also apply to the person charged with conducting the investigation.

Art. 13 – Carrying out the investigation

§1. Once he has been appointed by the competent Dicastery and acting

Art. 11 – Entrusting the investigation to a person other than the Metropolitan

- §1. If the competent Dicastery considers it appropriate to entrust the investigation to a person other than the Metropolitan, the Metropolitan is so informed. The Metropolitan delivers all relevant information and documents to the person appointed by the Dicastery.
- §2. In the case referred to in the previous paragraph, the following provisions relating to the Metropolitan apply to the person charged with conducting the investigation.

Art. 12 – Carrying out the investigation

§1. Once he has been appointed by the competent Dicastery and

in accordance with the instructions received **on the manner of proceeding**, the Metropolitan, either personally or through one or more suitable persons:

- a) collects relevant information regarding the facts;
- b) accesses the information and documents necessary for the purpose of the investigation kept in the archives of ecclesiastical offices;
- c) obtains the cooperation of other Ordinaries or Hierarchs whenever necessary;
- d) if deemed appropriate and with respect to the provisions of §7 of this article, requests information from individuals and institutions, including civil institutions, that are able to provide useful elements for the investigation.
- §2. If it is necessary to hear from a minor or a vulnerable adult, the Metropolitan shall adopt appropriate procedures, which take into account their condition and the laws of the State.
- §3. In the event that there are well-founded motives to conclude that information or documents concerning the investigation are at risk of being removed or destroyed, the Metropolitan shall take the necessary measures for their preservation.
- §4. Even when making use of other persons, the Metropolitan nevertheless remains responsible for the direction and conduct of the investigation, as well as for the

- acting in compliance with the instructions received, the Metropolitan, either personally or through one or more suitable persons:
- a) collects relevant information regarding the facts;
- b) accesses the information and documents necessary for the purpose of the investigation kept in the archives of ecclesiastical offices;
- c) obtains the cooperation of other Ordinaries or Hierarchs whenever necessary;
- d) requests information from individuals and institutions, including civil institutions, that are able to provide useful elements for the investigation.
- §2. If it is necessary to hear from a minor or a vulnerable person, the Metropolitan shall adopt appropriate procedures, which take into account their *status*.
- §3. In the event that there are well-founded motives to conclude that information or documents concerning the investigation are at risk of being removed or destroyed, the Metropolitan shall take the necessary measures for their preservation.
- §4. Even when making use of other persons, the Metropolitan nevertheless remains responsible for the direction and conduct of the investigation, as well as for

timely execution of the instructions referred to in art. 11 §2.

- §5. The Metropolitan shall be assisted by a notary freely appointed pursuant to canons 483 §2 CIC and 253 §2 CCEO.
- §6. The Metropolitan is required to act impartially and free of conflicts of interest. If he considers himself to have a conflict of interest or is unable to maintain the necessary impartiality to guarantee the integrity of the investigation, he is obliged to recuse himself and report the circumstance to the competent Dicastery. Likewise, anyone who believes there is a conflict of interest in the case is required to inform the competent Dicastery.
- §7. The person under investigation always enjoys the presumption of innocence and the legitimate protection of his or her good name.
- § 8. The Metropolitan, if requested by the competent Dicastery, informs the person of the investigation concerning him/her, hears his/her account of the facts and invites him/her to present a brief in defence. In such cases, the investigated person may be assisted by legal counsel.
- §9. In accordance with the instructions received, the Metropolitan periodically sends a status report on the state of the investigation to the competent Dicastery.

- the timely execution of the instructions referred to in article 10 §2.
- §5. The Metropolitan shall be assisted by a notary freely appointed pursuant to canons 483 §2 CIC and 253 §2 CCEO.
- §6. The Metropolitan is required to act impartially and free of conflicts of interest. If he considers himself to be in a conflict of interest or is unable to maintain the necessary impartiality to guarantee the integrity of the investigation, he is obliged to recuse himself and report the circumstance to the competent Dicastery.
- §7. The person under investigation enjoys the presumption of innocence.
- § 8. The Metropolitan, if requested by the competent Dicastery, informs the person of the investigation concerning him/her, hears his/her account of the facts and invites him/her to present a brief in defence. In such cases, the investigated person may be assisted by legal counsel.
- §9. Every thirty days, the Metropolitan sends a status report on the state of the investigation to the competent Dicastery.

Art. 14 – Involvement of qualified persons

- §1. In accordance with any possible directives of the Episcopal Conference, of the Synod of Bishops or of the Council of Hierarchs regarding how to assist the Metropolitan in conducting the investigation, it would be very useful if the Bishops of the respective Province, individually or together, establish lists of qualified persons from which the Metropolitan may choose those most suitable to assist in the investigation, according to the needs of the individual case and, in particular, taking into account the cooperation that can be offered by the lay faithful pursuant to canons 228 CIC and 408 CCEO.
- §2. The Metropolitan, however, is free to choose other equally qualified persons.
- §3. Any person assisting the Metropolitan in the investigation is required to act impartially and must be free of conflicts of interest. If he considers himself to be in a conflict of interest or unable to maintain the necessary impartiality required to guarantee the integrity of the investigation, he is obliged to recuse himself and report the circumstances to the Metropolitan.
- §4. The persons assisting the Metropolitan shall take an oath to fulfil their charge properly, with respect to the provisions of art. 13 §7.

Art. 13 – Involvement of qualified persons

- §1. In accordance with any eventual directives of the Episcopal Conference, of the Synod of Bishops or of the Council of Hierarchs regarding how to assist the Metropolitan in conducting the investigation, the Bishops of the respective Province, individually or together, may establish lists of qualified persons from which the Metropolitan may choose those most suitable to assist in the investigation, according to the needs of the individual case and, in particular, taking into account the cooperation that can be offered by the lay faithful pursuant to canons 228 CIC and 408 CCEO.
- §2. The Metropolitan, however, is free to choose other equally qualified persons.
- §3. Any person assisting the Metropolitan in the investigation is required to act impartially and must be free of conflicts of interest. If he considers himself to be in a conflict of interest or be unable to maintain the necessary impartiality required to guarantee the integrity of the investigation, he is obliged to recuse himself and report the circumstances to the Metropolitan.
- §4. The persons assisting the Metropolitan shall take an oath to fulfil their charge properly.

Art. 15 - Duration of the investigation

- §1. The investigation is to be completed **in short order** and in accordance with the instructions listed in art. **11** §2.
- §2. Where there are just reasons, and after having sent a report on the status of the investigation, the Metropolitan may request that the competent Dicastery extend the time period.

Art. 14 - Duration of the investigation

- §1. The investigation is to be completed within the term of ninety days or within a term otherwise provided for by the instructions referred to in article 10 §2.
- §2. Where there are just reasons, the Metropolitan may request that the competent Dicastery extend the term.

Art. 16 - Precautionary measures

Should the facts or circumstances require it, the Metropolitan shall propose to the competent Dicastery the adoption of provisions or appropriate precautionary measures with regard to the person under investigation. The Dicastery shall adopt the provisions after having consulted the Pontifical Representative.

Art. 15 - Precautionary measures

Should the facts or circumstances require it, the Metropolitan shall propose to the competent Dicastery the adoption of provisions or appropriate precautionary measures with regard to the person under investigation.

Art. 17 - Establishment of a fund

- §1. Ecclesiastical Provinces, Episcopal Conferences, Synods of Bishops and Councils of Hierarchs may create a fund, to be established according to the norms of canons 116 and 1303 §1, 1° CIC and 1047 CCEO and administered according to the norms of canon law, whose purpose is to sustain the costs of the investigations.
- §2. At the request of the appointed Metropolitan, the funds necessary for the purpose of the investigation are made available to him by the administrator of the fund; the Metropolitan remains duty-bound

Art. 16 - Establishment of a fund

- §1. Ecclesiastical Provinces, Episcopal Conferences, Synods of Bishops and Councils of Hierarchs may create a fund, to be established according to the norms of canons 116 and 1303 §1, 1° CIC and 1047 CCEO and administered according to the norms of canon law, whose purpose is to sustain the costs of the investigations.
- §2. At the request of the appointed Metropolitan, the funds necessary for the purpose of the investigation are made available to him by the

administrator of the fund; the to present an account to the administrator at the conclusion of Metropolitan remain duty-bound to present an account to the the investigation. administrator at the conclusion of the investigation. Art. 18 - Transmission of the acts Art. 17-Transmission of the and the votum documents and the votum §1. Having completed the §1. Having completed the investigation, the Metropolitan investigation, the Metropolitan shall transmit the original version shall transmit the acts to the competent Dicastery, together of the acts to the competent with his votum regarding the Dicastery, together with his votum regarding the results of results of the investigation and in the investigation and in response to response to any queries contained any queries contained in the in the instructions issued under instructions issued under art. 11 article 10 §2. §2. A copy of the acts is to be kept in the Archive of the competent Pontifical Representative. §2. Unless there are further §2. Unless there are further instructions from the competent instructions from the competent Dicastery, the faculties of the Dicastery, the faculties of the Metropolitan cease once the Metropolitan cease once the investigation is completed. investigation is completed. §3. In compliance with the §3. In compliance with the instructions of the competent instructions of the competent Dicastery, the Metropolitan, upon Dicastery, the Metropolitan, upon request, shall inform the person request, shall inform the person who has alleged an offence and, who has alleged an offence, or when applicable, the person who his/her legal representatives, of made the report, or their legal the outcome of the investigation. representatives of the outcome of the investigation. Art. 19 - Subsequent measures Art. 18 - Subsequent measures Unless it decides to provide for a Unless it decides to provide for a supplementary investigation, the supplementary investigation, the competent Dicastery proceeds in competent Dicastery proceeds in accordance with the law provided accordance with the law provided for the specific case. for the specific case. Art. 20 - Compliance with state Art. 19 - Compliance with state laws laws

These norms apply without prejudice to the rights and obligations established in each place by state laws, particularly those concerning any reporting obligations to the competent civil authorities.

These norms apply without prejudice to the rights and obligations established in each place by state laws, particularly those concerning any reporting obligations to the competent civil authorities.

I establish that the present Apostolic Letter issued Motu Proprio be promulgated by means of publication in *L'Osservatore Romano*, entering into force on 30 April 2023, and then published in the *Acta Apostolicae Sedis*. With its entry into force, the preceding Apostolic Letter issued Motu Proprio, promulgated on 7 May 2019, will be abrogated.

The present norms are approved *ad experimentum* for three years.

I establish that the present Apostolic Letter in the form of Motu Proprio be promulgated by means of publication in *L'Osservatore Romano*, entering into force on 1 *June 2019*, and then published in *the Acta Apostolicae Sedis*.

Given in Rome, at Saint Peter's, on 25 March 2023, Solemnity of the Annunciation of the Lord, the eleventh year of my Pontificate.

Given in Rome, at Saint Peter's, on 7 May 2019, the seventh year of my Pontificate.

FRANCIS

FRANCIS