

ASIAN

HORIZONS

Vol. 13, No. 1, March 2019

BOOK REVIEW

Thomas G. Guarino, *The Disputed Teachings of Vatican II: Continuity and Reversal in Catholic Doctrine*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2018. Pages: ix + 214. ISBN 9780802874382.

Rupture or development? This is the question about Vatican II (1962-5) around which the book revolves: the council which has greatly influenced the Catholic church during the last half-century, affected other Christian churches, and impacted upon the wider world. Guarino is responding, therefore, to an important question and one for which he is well qualified: professor of systematic Theology at Seton Hall University, New Jersey, co-chair of the initiative 'Evangelicals and Catholics Together,' and a well-established author. Jared Wicks, formerly dean of the Theology faculty at the Gregorian University in Rome, sums up thus on the dust-jacket: the book 'should become a landmark in interpreting Vatican II, because it penetrates into the deeper theological strata of the major documents.'

After the Introduction, the volume is divided into five chapters. The first, entitled "The Central Problem of Vatican II," explores the question of why the council still remains contentious more than fifty years after its conclusion. With this in mind two theologians are highlighted – Vincent of Lérins, writing in the fifth-century, already the subject of several articles by Guarino, and John Henry Newman – while others are considered more briefly: popes John Paul II and Benedict XVI, cardinal Bouillard and Yves Congar. Concluding the chapter, the section "Vatican II and doctrinal development" sums up on the relevant issues and personalities.

The next chapter is entitled "Theological Principles for Understanding Vatican II." Theologians treated in the first chapter are revisited and the writings of other personalities are considered: the Belgians cardinal Suenens and Gérard Philips, Hans Küng, Karl Rahner, the Jesuit historian John O'Malley, the Melchite patriarchal vicar Elias Zoghby, the archbishop of Lubumbashi in the Congo, Henri de Lubac, Léon Elchinger, coadjutor archbishop of Strasbourg, who deplored overmuch emphasis on uniformity in the Catholic church,

Christian Fouchet, France's minister of Education, who thought the bishops at the council were "doing a bad job" by "calling everything into question," and others. The chapter moves, finally, to the "massive topic" of "theological notes or qualifications" and the binding nature of conciliar decrees.

Chapter 3, entitled "Key Words for Change," looks at the importance of three factors during the council and afterwards: development, *ressourcement* and *aggiornamento*. Through them, many hoped, rupture could be avoided. The last two chapters focus on various disputed topics and carry the titles "Disputed Topics and Analogical Reasoning" and "Disputed Topics and Material Continuity."

The book is very well documented, with many informative footnotes. It finishes with a concise Conclusion; a Bibliography of the most important publications, including English translations when available; and a well ordered Index with sub-headings in the longer entries, thereby enabling documents and individuals to be viewed from different perspectives. Altogether the reader can learn much about the council and how it has been interpreted, in terms of both its teachings and its personalities.

Norman Tanner SJ (tanner@unigre.it)