

clearly written and the arguments are very well supported with factual detail. Sources are indicated in the footnotes: all are published sources rather than unpublished archival material. Regarding layout, the Contents page includes only the twelve chapter headings: it would have been helpful to have there also the main sub-headings within the chapters. Twenty-one illustrations are well chosen to highlight key personalities and attitudes. An extensive Bibliography, a short "Index of Themes," covering both countries and topics, and a much fuller index of persons, titled "Index of Names," conclude the book.

As one whose early life was dominated by the war and accounts about it, the book is for me both fascinating and deeply disturbing. For those younger and without this immediate knowledge, it should still be very informative as well as instructive.

Norman Tanner, SJ (tanner@unigre.it)

Kristin M. Colberg, *Vatican I and Vatican II: Councils in the Living Tradition*, Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 2016. Pages: xiii+162. ISBN: 978-0-8146-8314-9

'Living Tradition,' in the sub-title, is understood principally as the half-century from the end of Vatican II (1962-5) until the publication of this book, though with some appreciation of the century between Vatican I (1869-70) and Vatican II as well as recognition that this living tradition has not ended in 2016 but will continue to develop further.

It is good to have the two councils compared sympathetically (p. viii), rather than in opposition to each other as has been the case so often. Welcome, too, is the insistence that Vatican I's declaration of papal infallibility — the topic for which this council is principally remembered — was more limited as well as less rigid than is normally assumed, thanks to the long and lively debate at the council on the issue and the need to reach a formula that would be acceptable to the minority opposed to, or uneasy with, any definition of infallibility. Thus the declaration does not say directly that the pope is infallible, rather than in special circumstances he enjoys the infallibility which Jesus Christ willed his church — which Vatican II would interpret as the people of God alongside the hierarchy — to possess. The final voting was 553 in favour of the definition and only two against; though more than one hundred bishops absented themselves rather than vote against the decree. Subsequently, the two dissentient bishops (of Caiazzo in southern Italy and Little Rock in Arkansas, USA) and all the absentees declared allegiance to the decree, so there was no schism among the bishops of the Catholic church.

Any council must be seen within its historical context and Colberg provides a good summary of the cultural, political and religious background at the time of the council — mainly that of western Europe — together with some consideration of earlier councils and movements — principally the two councils of Constance and Trent as well as Gallicanism and allied movements — though more attention might have been given to relevant issues in the church during the fourteen centuries before Constance. She also illustrates well that ecumenical councils should not be seen in isolation from each other, rather there is development. Vatican I, therefore, must be seen within the context of Vatican II.

However, the importance of context and hermeneutics should not be pushed too far. Text always has priority, even though the text of a decree cannot be understood without some appreciation of the language and historical context within which it came to be composed. In the case of Vatican I, the crucial section on papal infallibility is short and was highlighted: a single paragraph which is introduced with a higher level of authority than is found anywhere else in the council's decrees: 'We teach and define as a divinely revealed dogma...' It is regrettable that Colberg does not give the reader the text of this short paragraph. Maybe she also downplays the importance of papal infallibility within the overall agenda of the council (p. 22). The original agenda was to debate quite a wide range of topics and this programme had to be radically shortened to just two decrees — that on faith and reason, and that on the Church — on account of the capture of Rome by the troops of the Italian Risorgimento and the outbreak of the Franco-Prussian war. Even so, Pope Pius IX made it clear before and during the council that the definition of papal infallibility should be the council's principal objective.

The text is well supported with references to primary and secondary sources, which are indicated in the footnotes. Regrettably these sources are not collected together into a Bibliography. An index comprising topics as well as persons concludes this excellent and thought-provoking study.

Norman Tanner, SJ (tanner@unigre.it)

Luigi Giussani, *Christ, God's Companion with Man*, Montreal and London: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2015. Pages: 128, £10.99. ISBN: 978-0-7735-4566-3

This is the English translation of the Italian original, *Cristo compagna di Dio all'uomo*, published in 2014. Luigi Giussani (1922-