## ASIAN HORIZONS

Vol. 14, No. 3, September 2020 Pages: 782-796

## **BOOK REVIEWS**

Kristin E. Heyer, James F. Keenan, Andrea Vicini, ed., Building Bridges in Sarajevo: The Plenary Papers form CTEWC 2018, Maryknoll, New York, Orbis Books, 2019. Pages: xvii+228. ISBN: 9781626983427.

Building Bridges in Sarajevo: The Plenary Papers form CTEWC 2018 papers of the third international conference of CTEWC—is the seventh book in the series of CTEWC publication. The book series "responds to the challenges of pluralism, the call to dialogue from and beyond local culture, and the need to interconnect within a world church. While pursuing critical and emerging issues in theological ethics, CTEWC engages in cross-cultural, interdisciplinary conversations motivated by mercy and care and shaped by shared visions of hope," says James F. Keenan, the series editor (ii).

The book celebrates a blueprint of the architecture of "building bridges" through conversations. Mary Mee-Yin Yuen suggests the process of networking: "We act not because we see hope. We see hope when we act" (132), the unifying chord of the volume, sung by different women and men theologians from different parts of the world.

*Building Bridges in Sarajevo* traces the footprints of the networking of CTEWC from its beginning—a coming together of six moral theologians in Rome in the year 2002—to its third international conference held in Sarajevo in 2018.

The eight plenary sessions of the conference are printed in the book, focussing on different phases of the CTEWC and presenting manifold voices and faces in building bridges by addressing the pressing challenges people face in different parts of the world. The volume is dedicated to Enrico Dolazza.

The first plenary is a description on the opening of the conference and entrusting the responsibilities of leadership on the shoulders of Kristin E. Heyer, Andrea Vicini, SJ and Shaji George Kochuthara, CMI, by James F. Keenan, SJ, the founder of the international network CTEWC. James F. Keenan, in his opening address, presents a concise story of CTCWC. Kristin Heyer introduces the dynamics of the conference. She appeals to the members, "may we collectively imagine new possibilities for pursuing theological ethics beyond well-paved paths in our disciplines and settings" (10). Andrea Vicini builds bridges by narrating "who are we here today, where we come from, and what helped us to be in Sarajevo" (12). In his paper on "Building Bridges through Dialogue and Networking," Shaji George Kochuthara recognizes the anomaly in the society, "although we speak about a more interconnected and interdependent world, we find tendencies towards building walls and breaking bridges" (15). At this challenging time, he states that our "mission as ethicists is to build bridges between the poor and the rich, between cultures, and between religions, so that we can exist together in peace and harmony" (17).

The second plenary "Our Origins and Contexts: Why We Network" presents a panel of seven witnesses and from three voices: "Senior Voices," "Emerging Voices" and "Isolated Voices." A strong proponent of pluralism, Antonio Autiero argues that "plurality does not reduce the space occupied by the agreements. On the contrary, it opens up this space, expands it, and makes it fruitful and rich in its implications" (22). Paul Schotsmans recounts the start of Catholic ethics in the world Church and invites the readers "to go forward and to make our Catholic dialogue an open house for many opinions and for the integration of emerging theologies in the twenty-first century" (26). Sr Vimala Chenginimattam, CMC, shares the context of her studies in moral theology and realizes her mission as "the promotion and defence of women's genius, thereby propagating an integral vision of what it means to be human" (31). Rooted in his experiences, Gusztáv Kovács childhood underscores that "Friendships are not planned; they happen and evolve by "seizing the moment" (34). Margret Ssebunya narrates her journey to moral theology and believes that "we must not forget to listen to the voices of the underprivileged, especially the voices of women and girls" (39). Zorica Maros, a theologian from Sarajevo, joining with Ivo Andrić, argues that "bridges are more important than houses, more holy than temples, because they serve to all equally" (42). She proposes, "Ethics is a construction, just like a bridge, which needs another shore to fulfil the purpose of its existence. Ethics, just like a bridge, which is a symbol of human victory over the forces of nature, a bridge that connects the real, present world to the one that might, or perhaps should be" (42). Nhu Y. Lan Tran, CND, the first Catholic

woman moral theologian in Vietnam, is committed to "work for harmony and dialogue, striving to sow the seeds of hope, peace, and joy, and to build up the bridge of forgiveness, of dialogue, and of harmony" (45).

The third plenary "Continental Reflections since Padua and Trento" traces the roadmap of the networking of CTEWC. Anne Celestine Achieng, FSJ, discusses the various approaches and achievements of African liberation theology and highlights the importance of social values and peaceable structures. Bienvenu Mayemba, SJ, states that "It is imperative to acknowledge both unity of our faith and the plurality of our theological investigations and to reaffirm that different contexts produce different theologies" (57). Stanislaus Alla, SJ, in his paper discusses "Interreligious Dialogue: An Indian Way" and proposes the church "to regenerate through interreligious dialogue our national and time-tested ethos and values, built on plurality and diversity and modelled after the Dharma of Jesus" (64). Paulus Bambang Irawan, SJ, sees a silver lining in the midst of important challenges faced by the youth of Asia, namely, economic inequality, the rising tide of digital activism, and the increasing fundamentalism in Asia. He emphasises the network of mercy and hope where the youth journey together. The author capitalizes on the youth, "in the heart of the university, there exists none other than the youth" (70). Michelle Becka posits Christian social ethics as context-sensitive human rights ethics. The author suggests "to engage against polarization and division, against policy of fear that causes exclusion, and for solidarity in Europe" (75). Petr Štica focuses on human rights and migration and recommends, "Theology should help to cultivate and refine the public debate on migration, as well as immigration and refugee policy, so as to highlight its deficiencies" (80). Emilce Cuda sees the meeting in Sarajevo, the city of bridges, as "symbolic of our mission as a church that is on the road" (83). The paper draws a few useful insights into doing theological ethics, "there should be no ethics without a culture; neither are relevant without a people; people are not a category but a concrete reality; and only a people can be manifested as a cultural ethos" (84). Elio Gasda, SJ, states that all ethical-theological discourse is situated in the context of the theologian. He recommends to put forth a theology "in symphony with the plural identity of the Latin American community" (90). Victor Carmona's paper "Bridge-Building with Virtue Ethics in Times of Strangeness," proposes "humble attempts to be in solidarity with immigrants and refugees, and join the many others who minister to them in their own

vocations as we all lay bridges across our worlds, together, in hope" (95). Kate Ward states, "Virtue ethics in social contexts demonstrates that my own moral goodness and my neighbour's flourishing are not separate concerns, but rather are radically interlinked" (104).

The fourth plenary takes up "Challenges We Confront Today: Climate Crisis and Political Crises" for dialogue. George Kodithottam, SJ, illustrates the phenomenon of farmers' suicides as "an identity assertion-a form of resistance to the model of development being followed by the Indian state" (113). In his paper, "A Nation in Crisis: Trump as Cause and Effect," Kenneth R. Himes, OFM, hopes "the Catholic community can join with other people of good will to work on behalf of those who need bread, who want politics to be nursing, to be about substance, to serve the common good" (120). Ludovic Lado, SJ, contends that the invisibility of the laity in politics remains "the main obstacle to the translation of social ethics into political practice in Africa" (126). From her Hong Kong experience Mary Mee-Yin Yuen delineates a number of symptoms of political crisis in her land and she suggests "the need to offer ethical insights to each other in order to bring hope for change" (132). Charles E. Curran in his paper "Responding to Contemporary Crises: Resources from the Tradition" affirms "the human act must always be considered in relation to the person who places the act" (138) and in discussing the principle of subsidiarity, he holds the view that "the human person is prior to the state and cannot be subordinated to it" (141).

"Ethics and Public Discourse" was the theme of the fifth plenary. Teresa Forcades i Vila presents three key elements essential for public engagement as a Christian ethicist: a joyful but questioning inner disposition; the conviction that there are only two absolutes (God and hunger); the willingness to lovingly cause and endure conflict (149-150). In the context of the Philippines, Eric Marcelo O. Genilo, SJ, advocates "protecting the vulnerable, overcoming divisions, and taking up the challenge of dialogue" (153). "Humility and prophecy" (155) are the two hallmarks necessary to engage public discourse, says Alexandre A. Martins, MI. Cardinal Blase J. Cupich exhorts, "it is the people, especially the poor, who evangelize us, who proclaim and bring about the salvation we always longed for and that God has forever intended" (163).

The sixth plenary discusses "Dialogical Theologies of Reconciliation." Elias Opongo, SJ, proposes *conversational reconciliation* (168) towards creating an alternative future "where human dignity is respected and the common good is safeguarded"

(171). Alain Thomasset, SJ, insists on "the need to learn from the poor and from refugees" (173) and concludes that the "encounters with refugees and migrants are opportunities for conversion" (176). In her paper "Is Peace Possible in Latin America and the Caribbean without Land Distribution," Susana Nuin Núñez underlines the importance of evolving structures and methods "founded on dialogue that opens horizons of equitable distribution of land, and also generates other types of economy that do not endanger the planet and that respect the person and their communities" (181).

The seventh plenary deliberates upon "Networking for Social Impact." Shawnee M. Daniels-Sykes discusses the Academy of Catholic Hispanic Theologians of the United States and the Black Catholic Theological Symposium. Sr Alison Munro, OP, reports on the work of the South African Catholic Bishops' Conference on HIV/AIDS. Kristine Meneses presents the ongoing legacy of the Ecclesia of Women in Asia (EWA), the only continental organization of Catholic women theologians in Asia. She recounts that the EWA along with publications takes "a stance of active solidarity with and for the silenced" (196). Msgr Francisco Niño Súa gives an example of networking for social impact from the Latin American Bishops' Council (CELAM). He writes, "the Christian name of networking is communion" (197) and "The family name of our networking is Catholicity" (198). The CELAM serves with a framework of an attitude of subsidiarity, the affective as the effective, and the richness of the differences (198-99).

The eighth plenary "Prophetic Sending Forth," postulates a takeaway from the conference. Pablo A. Blanco calls "Bridge-Building" theological ethics as a brand new theological approach. He invites the ethicists "to find out how much God is present in reality, even if just seminally" (205). The author describes four theological places—history, people of God, culture, and the poor—and three dimensions—Marian, missionary discipleship, and epistemological—to pursue theological ethics (206-8).

The only destination of bridge building is "the transformation of unjust realities of many brothers and sisters who inhabit our continents" (208). Emmanuel Katongole lists seven convictions of an emerging prophetic theological ethics in our time: theological ethics is a theology of hope; everything is interconnected; an understanding of spiritual crisis; a theology of critique and denouncement; announcing a new order; a new kind of knowledge; and a call for bold action (211-215). In her paper, "Vulnerability: An Ethic for a Divided World," Linda Hogan capitalizes on an ethic of vulnerability "as a way of being; as the ground of our relationality; and as the mode of social engagement" (216). She rightly contends that "shared vulnerability and mutual dependence may be precisely the qualities that have a resonance with the individuals and communities worldwide who are struggling to find the grounds for the hope of a shared future in a world divided" (220). To add to the train of thought on vulnerability, it is proper to ask a question: Is not the human vulnerability unfolded in the life of Jesus and especially on the Cross of Christ? Theological ethics devoid of the mystery of the Cross of Christ may miss the magic of wisdom and power to carry on the mission of the ethicist.

Building Bridges in Sarajevo showcases the vision and priorities of CTEWC encompassing reality almost in its totality. However, in building bridges, if theological ethicists have nothing to do with the liturgical celebration (prayer, spirituality, worship, assembly, etc.,) of the Church—the bedrock of networking of Catholics—the whole project of networking and building bridges would be bankrupt and missing the mark of being a Catholic.

*Building Bridges in Sarajevo* is different from abstract, speculative, and argumentative ethical discussions; it unfolds theological ethics from a personal, societal, narrative point of view akin to the biblical tradition rooted in the context of life and its challenges.

*Building Bridges in Sarajevo* takes me to an insight of Jonas Thaliath, CMI on theology: "faith seeking harmony of life," through Jesus Christ, the key to theology. *Building Bridges in Sarajevo* is a sweet struggle to celebrate harmony of life in Christ, wherever the theologians and faithful are placed. *Building Bridges in Sarajevo* shares the concern of Pope Francis, "we are called to recognize every sign and mobilize all our energy in order to remove the walls of division and to build bridges of fraternity everywhere in the world" (xv).

Paulachan Kochappilly, CMI, DVK (paulachan.kochappilly@cmi.in)

Katarina Schuth, Seminary Formation: Recent History, Current Circumstances, New Directions, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2016, Pages: xii+191. ISBN 978-0-8146-4800-1.

Seminary Formation: Recent History, Current Circumstances, New Directions is an excellent book, written by Katarina Schuth. The volume has seven chapters in four parts. The seventh chapter in the last part contains commentaries of five eminent scholars who were also part of her committee of advisers in the process of doing research for the book. Archbishop of Chicago, Blase J. Cupich, has written a