SEXUAL ABUSE SCANDAL AND ITS IMPLICATIONS FOR SEMINARY FORMATION

Gabriel Mathias, OFM
St Antony’s Friary, Bangalore

Abstract
According to research on the crisis of clerical abuse of minors in the Catholic church, especially the report of the John Jay College Research Team (2011), *The Causes and Context of Sexual Abuse of Minors by Catholic Priests in the United States*, defective human formation in seminaries contributed to the crisis. The article deals with ways of remedying the situation proposing suggestions for integrated celibate living and supports for achieving celibacy. Specific to paedophilia, there are details of the red-flags and warning signs that the formators need to pay attention to, as well as ways to address intimacy deficits, boundary violations and stress points in ministry which can trigger abuse.

**Keywords:** Boundary Violations; Celibacy; Celibate Achievement; Clerical Sexual Abuse; Dual Relationships; Intimacy Deficit; Paedophilic Disorder; Seminary Formation; Sexuality; Sexual Integration

Introduction
One of the questions often asked in the context of the clerical sexual abuse scandal which has rocked the Catholic Church first in USA and later in the rest of the Catholic world in the recent past is

---

Fr Gabriel Mathias OFM holds a licentiate degree from the Institute of Psychology of the Gregorian University, Rome. He has been a regular visiting lecturer at Seminaries such as St Pius X Seminary, Mumbai, St Peter’s Seminary, Bangalore as well as at formation Institutes in India such as AVP, NBCLC, NVSC, etc. In his Franciscan province, besides teaching and being a formator for many years he has been the Vice provincial as well as the General Councillor of his Order. At present he is the Superior at St Anthony’s Friary, Bangalore. Email: gmathias50@gmail.com
why this has happened and what can be done to remedy the situation for the future.

Many of those who have analyzed the causes of the scandal have referred to as one of the main causes the inadequate formation on sexuality in the seminaries.

Some Psychologists are of the opinion that a major reason for the sexual abuse by Catholic priests is that these men are grossly unaware of their sexuality and very immature and that the Catholic church does a poor job of educating seminarians about how to cope with sexual feelings. Clergy have been found to have more sexual identity-confusion problems than non-clerical offenders.

A.W. Richard Sipe\textsuperscript{1} who has done extensive research on celibate priests reports that according to celibates he studied, training programs of ecclesial systems failed in the knowledge of how to be celibate in three ways: 1) avoidance of sexuality, 2) dependence on a system of secrecy, and 3) lack of personal witness. Formation in the area of sexuality in the seminaries is often confined to the study of the documents on celibacy and what to avoid.

The report of John Jay College of Criminal justice, \textit{The Causes and Context of Sexual Abuse of Minors by Catholic Priests in the United States, 1950-2010} \textsuperscript{2} provides well-researched answers to key questions about the abuse crisis. The John Jay College of Criminal Justice spent nearly five years conducting this unprecedented study, which was commissioned by the U.S. Conference of Catholic Bishops at a cost of 1.8 million dollars.

According to this study, formation of seminarians seems to have played a significant role in the likelihood of a man becoming an abuser. The majority of offenders during the 60-year period of the study were ordained prior to the 1970s; 44 percent of offenders entered the priesthood before 1960. Several generations of priest-abusers lacked careful preparation for celibate life, as demonstrated by the fact that 70 percent of them engaged in sexual activity with adults as well as children.

Moreover, these abusers failed to recognize the harm they did to their victims. When most of these offenders were in seminary, the


training was focused on academics, theology and spirituality with little attention paid to seminarians’ growth as mature adults. In recent years, formation programs have emphasized relationships and friendships, self-knowledge, integrity and celibate chastity. As seminaries gradually intensified the focus of formation on the “human” aspect of development, the number of incidents of abuse began to diminish.

This can be clearly seen in the graph below:

Commenting on this statistic the report states:

Over the past twenty-five years, a remarkable intensification of human formation and deeper understanding of the importance of its role are evident in almost every seminary. Over the same period, the total number of accusations of sexual abuse of a minor by a Catholic priest has fallen from 975 for the period of 1985 through 1989 to 253 for the period of 1995 through 1999, and then to 73 for the period of 2004 through 2008. An awareness of the problem of sexual abuse surely informed the development of the curriculum, but the benefits to seminarians may be seen in the continuing very low levels of sexual abuse of minors. As is discussed in the final chapter of this report, it is critical to ensure that priests continue to receive human formation training in seminary. One recommendation we make is for continued education on human formation to ensure that priests have the training and support to overcome any individual vulnerabilities they may face...³

This article will focus on practical suggestions for formation in seminaries on human formation related to integration of sexuality with particular reference to paedophilia.

1. Formation for Integrated Celibate Living

It must be noted at the outset that no short course in the curriculum in the seminary can bring about sexual integration. While information is necessary and important, information by itself does not produce transformation.

Skills to be learned in order to grow in celibacy, make sense only when one’s sexuality is seen in the context of the whole personality in an integrated manner rather than cut off from the rest of the personality. The training for celibacy cannot be too specific focusing on sexuality apart from the rest of the personality; it is part of the integrated training of the whole person of the seminarian or future priest. In fact, sexuality becomes un-integrated and ugly when it is seen out of the context of the whole human person. Celibacy is a whole way of life and is a fundamental component of priestly spirituality. It is not something which is learned in an exclusively academic setting or in a “single semester course.” It implies learning to live a style of life which supports the choice of celibacy. Just as an academic person or an artist or a poet has a style of life which supports his main career choice, so must the celibate. By style of life I mean, mode of dressing, talking, eating, drinking, recreating, the circle of friends, books one reads, TV programs one watches, daily schedule, etc.

1.1. Programs of Celibacy Formation in Seminaries

In 1999, the National Catholic Educational Association (NCEA) of USA, published a resource book for the celibacy formation of diocesan priests. Here, Krenik proposes seven guiding elements to be used in celibacy formation with graduate seminarians: 1) internalization of presbyteral values; 2) pattern of contemplative prayer; 3) capacity for solitude; 4) age-appropriate psychosexual development; 5) capacity for intimacy in human friendships; 6) experience of community support; and 7) accountability to others.

---


John Mark Falken Hain⁶ adds the following elements to the formation for celibacy program: 1) Motives for Celibacy 2) Strengths & Skills for Living Celibate Chastity 3) Theologies of Celibacy 4) Limitations for Living Celibate Chastity 5) Sexual Identity: Sex + Gender + Sexual Orientation 6) History of Sexual Experiences 7) Values & Attitudes Regarding sex.

1.2. Essential Elements of Celibate Achievement

A.W. Richard Sipe⁷ in his research with priests was interested in finding out the supports that had helped priests who had achieved celibacy in their lives.

Based on the experience of priests who had been successful in living celibacy in their life, and studying the spiritual writers such as St Benedict, Ignatius of Loyola, etc., who mediated celibate life-style to others, he found ten essential inter-related elements in the spiritual, psychological and physical areas which helped the celibates to achieve celibacy. What follows is a summary of these ten supports for celibate achievement.

1. Work: Celibate achievers were involved in meaningful work. This refers to mastery and productive use of one’s energies and time rather than with a particular task.

2. Prayer and interiority: This states the obvious. “I have never interviewed a man who has attained celibacy without finding in him rich and active prayer life,” says Sipe.

3. Community: A sense of themselves as a part of a community was important for the celibate achievers. They seemed to know the answer to the Gospel question: “Who is my mother, brother and sister?”

4. Service: For celibate achievers, work, prayer and community are united in the awareness of service as a meaningful existence.

5. Attention to Physical needs: Celibate achievers paid sufficient attention to their physical needs without exaggeration. One said, “If I don’t assure myself enough legitimate pleasure, I’m liable to seek the illegitimate.”

6. Balance: It refers to the regulating of the inner competing needs. Balance between various aspects of life: prayer, food, rest, work.

7. Security: Security is a universal human requisite for growth. It refers to “the sense of stability, enduring circumstances, rootedness in interpersonal relationships, with bonds to time, place and practical realities, one fundamental to growth and development.” Celibate achievers had a sense of security. Some found it in their faith.

8. Order: Richard Sipe says, “I never met a celibate achiever who lacked a sense of order in his daily and seasonal life.” While balance is a spiritual quality regulating the inner competing needs, order responds to the regulation of time and energy, whether prayer, work, study, hobbies, or recreation.

9. Learning: While not all celibate achievers were intellectuals, they all had love of learning, good reading habits. Love of learning and intellectual curiosity are related to celibate achievement. It is difficult to be a celibate without continued learning.

10. Beauty: Celibate achievers had love for beautiful things such as art, music, poetry, gardening, etc. which are legitimate means of sublimation. Many had hobbies in this sphere. There is a need for legitimate pleasure which takes the form of beauty in many celibate lives. Learning and beauty inspire people to think about the transcendent and higher values.

Formation programmes in the seminaries need to lay the foundation for all the above ten supports for celibacy in the seminary program which then need to be carried over into the life of the priest in his pastoral life.

Goals of sexuality formation are: 1) know oneself, self-knowledge; 2) accept oneself, self-acceptance and 3) express it chastely, self-gift.

2. Specific Elements in Formation to Address the Paedophilia Crisis

2.1. Paedophilia vs Paedophilic Disorder

It is important to have clarity on what we mean by paedophilia, a term whose meaning has undergone many changes in Psychiatric literature. Not all priests who were accused of molestation of minors in the USA were paedophiles in the strict sense of the term.

In 1980 the diagnostic and statistical (DSM) manual of the American Psychiatric Association, DSM III first identified paedophilia as when the act or fantasy of engaging in sexual activity with a child is preferred or exclusive. In 1987 in DSM-III R there was a revision: preferred or exclusive actions or fantasies was removed; individuals must act on their attractions or be markedly distressed by the attractions to receive the diagnosis. In 1994 the diagnosis is
revised again: In DSM-IV, multiple sexual acts with children now warranted a diagnosis regardless of other psychosocial factors present. This version removed that a person must have engaged in sexual activity but included that they must be distressed by their attractions. In 2000 in the revised version DSM-IV R the diagnosis could now be applied even if the person did not report distress as long as they acted on their attractions. The current understanding based on DSM V now provides a broader scope to diagnose paedophilia in individuals who deny sexual attraction to children, when there is substantial evidence of attraction, devoid of behaviour.

This is the first DSM in which paedophilia is considered a life-long condition. It distinguishes between paedophilia and paedophilic disorder. While some paedophiles do not act out with children or in child pornography, to be a disorder the person has to have acted on it and the paedophilic disorder may fluctuate over time.

2.2. Paedophilia: The Law, the Church and the Civil Authorities

Some wonder how it is possible that the catholic church allowed this problem of paedophilia develop and become a huge crisis. It has been said that one of the reasons is that the church dealt with it as a moral, spiritual and a psychological issue and so made arrangements for the spiritual and psychological health of the perpetrator priest through retreats, spiritual direction and therapy. The Church neglected to see that it is also a crime and a legal issue. More important, it focused mostly on the perpetrator and neglected to pay sufficient attention to the rights of the victim and harm done to the victim.

There should be sufficient attention paid to the legal and criminal aspects of paedophilia in seminary curriculum. Seminaries in India have begun to do this especially since the consequences of lack of knowledge of the Indian law on “Protection of Children from Sexual Offences Act 2012” (POCSO) can be very traumatic for the perpetrators and those in responsible positions such as Rectors of Seminaries and Bishops and those with children under their care. Once accused, one is presumed to be guilty till one proves one’s innocence and there is no provision of bail for the offence. Those in responsible positions who do not act are said to be abetting the crime and are also punishable. The latest instruction from Pope Francis Vos Estis Lux Mundi makes it amply clear that bishops and major superiors will be held responsible for their inaction with regard to sexual delicts by people under their jurisdiction.
What is still a lacuna in seminary curriculum is the lack of attention paid to the rights of the victim and the enormous harm done to the victim. My own experience in dealing with this issue is that seminarians and priests and religious authorities are rather naïve about the depth of the spiritual and psychological harm done to the victim.

2.3. Recognizing the Vulnerable Persons

“Is there not some way to identify paedophilic adults before they abuse our children?” This would be useful in screening out possible paedophiles at entry into the seminary.

Stephen J. Rosetti who has been the director of St Luke Institute, Silverspring, Maryland has helpful hints on recognizing possible paedophiles.8 I give below his opinion on psychological testing for paedophilia and a summary of the six red-flags he proposes and I add another to it based on others who have dealt with paedophiles.

According to Rosetti at present, there is no scientifically sound assessment tool that is sufficiently respective of the individual’s privacy to be used in a process of general screening for potential child sexual abusers.

Most often, adults afflicted with deviant sexual interests in children are largely indistinguishable from their peers—at least on the surface. They are “normal.” They are often well groomed and report very few, if any, distressing symptoms. Coupled with this is often a sophisticated and sometimes impenetrable denial. Rarely does anyone admit to being sexually aroused by children.

2.3.1. Intensive Psychosexual History and Six Red-flags

Although perpetrators of child sexual abuse rarely admit to themselves or others a sexual attraction to minors, they often reveal certain patterns of psychosexual problems. By taking an in-depth history and looking for psychosexual “red flags,” a clinician can identify a significant number of such adults. It should be noted that the “red-flags” are not proofs.

1. Confusion about sexual orientation

By the time adults reach their mid-twenties they have an awareness and acceptance of their sexual orientation. The 25–35 old

---

adult who cannot honestly admit his or her sexual orientation is in trouble. However, Confusion about sexual orientation does not necessarily signal the hidden presence of deviant pattern of sexual arousal. More probing is called for.

2. Childish interests and behaviour

Adults who sexually molest children often suffer from gross emotional immaturity. A mother of four who was married to a paedophile complained that she had to take care of five children. Her husband acted like a child and related to his wife as if she were his mother. Though they may physically be adults, psychologically they are children and may act like children and have childish interests. It is helpful to ask about hobbies, movies one likes, etc. One paedophile said he delighted in playing Santa Claus for the children. Rosetti proposes that one ask, "With whom do you spend your time off and vacations?"

3. Lack of peer relationships

Child molesters rarely, if ever, have satisfying relationships with other adults. As psychic children, they do not have the emotional tools to connect with their peers. If asked who their closest friend is, some mention a minor.

4. Extreme in developmental sexual experiences

When taking psychosexual history, clinician should ask directly and explicitly about their sexual experiences throughout their lives. It is found that many adults who sexually abuse children either had an excessive amount of sexual stimulation as a child or can recount almost no sexual experience whatever.

5. Personal history of childhood sexual abuse and / deviant sexual experiences.

Many priests who were molesters of minors were themselves sexually molested as children. Note, however, majority of those who are sexually abused as children do not go on to abuse children themselves.

6. An excessively passive, dependent, conforming personality

There is a common type of child molester in ministry whose personality is passive, dependent, and conforming.

7. Some add a seventh red-flag: If the contents of the fantasies during masturbation consistently involve minors.
Note: Any warning sign found by itself is not necessarily an indication that the subject will be sexually interested in minors.

2.3.2. *Six Variables that Predict Admission/ Diagnosis of Sexual Interest in Children*\(^9\)

- Never married\(^{10}\)
- Child pornography content included videos
- Child pornography content included sex stories involving children
- Evidence of interest in child pornography spanned 2 or more years
- Volunteered in a role with high access to children
- Engaged in online sexual communication with a minor or posed as a minor.

2.3.3. *Some Warning Signs of Preferential Offenders*

- always find reasons to spend time alone with minors;
- prefers time with minors to time with peers;
- gives gifts to minors, especially without permission of the superiors;
- goes overboard with physical contact with minors;
- always wants to wrestle or tickle minors;
- shows favouritism toward certain minors;
- treats minors like equals or adults;
- keeps secrets with minors;
- ignores policies about interacting with minors;
- breaks the rules with minors;
- uses inappropriate language with minors;
- tells “off-colour” jokes to minors.

2.4. *Paedophilia and Intimacy Deficits*

The John Jay College report has some findings which are very relevant for seminary formation: “Some research on what


\(^{10}\) This refers to paedophiles in general and obviously this cannot be taken as an indicator for celibates.
differentiates sexual offenders from both nonsexual offenders and nonoffenders in general revolves around the idea of intimacy deficits. Many sexual offenders report a lack of close adult relationships as well as a lack of intimacy in their relationships generally.”

Intimacy deficits are weakness or difficulties in developing healthy emotional relationship with others. Intimacy deficit increases the susceptibility to deviant sexual behaviour, due in part to lack of openness and honesty in relationships with mentors and peers.

It has been found that emotional congruence to children and adolescents may predict abuse. Emotional congruence describes the relationship between the adult abuser’s emotional needs and child’s characteristics. Many adults who abuse children have arousal connected with children.

According the John Jay college report,

More recent work has focused on intimacy across different types of adult relationships including friendship, family, romantic, and sexual relationships. In one such study, Bumby and Hansen found widespread intimacy deficits in both incarcerated rapists and child molesters, suggesting that these individuals experience a lack of intimacy in many different types of relationships including friendships with males, friendships with females, and relationships with family members. Rapists and child molesters reported significantly more loneliness than nonsexual offenders and community control subjects, and child molesting behaviours were the best single predictor of degree of fear of intimacy.

2.4.1. Skills for Appropriate Confiding

One of the main supports for celibacy is the presence of friends. For this the seminarian needs to develop skills for appropriate confiding. Men find confiding very difficult. Seminaries and Rectories often house people who engage in little self-disclosure. Their conversations are limited to “swapping stories” about the humorous happenings, either past or present, “solving the world’s problems” by airing opinions about what others should do.

---

Seldom do they share with others their worries, disappointments, values and faith.

Seminarians need to learn the skills in appropriate confiding. This needs to be done consciously and attention should be paid to the loners who do not belong to any kind of group or do not have any personal friends. They will have no one to turn to and confide in when they have difficulties with their priestly or celibate life, neither will they feel any sense of guilt out of allegiance to a group if they have to abandon priesthood and celibacy.

Bonding among members of the presbyterate begins during seminary days when the friendships are created among the contemporaries which can be a support in the ministry.

2.4.2. Skills in Relating to Members of the Complementary Sex

Often our seminary formation does not prepare the future priests to relate with members of the complementary sex, especially when no natural contacts are encouraged. Most of our seminary formation is done in same-sex environment. Immediately after ordination, however, the priest has to deal with people of both sexes. Many young priests get into problematic relationships with women in their first years of priesthood because they are not prepared to deal with such relationships.

Most adolescents, especially those coming from villages in India with taboos against free interaction between sexes, are shy with regard to interacting with the complementary sex. Guided opportunity for interacting with members of the complementary sex can be provided during seminary days. Fearful or negative attitudes towards members of the opposite sex need to be dealt with when present.

Another formative experience that can be provided is having female members in the seminary teaching staff. In fact, I have noticed that some seminarians find it easier to confide in female spiritual directors possibly because of the maternal connect.

In his exhortation *Amoris Laetitia* Pope Francis makes a special mention about the need to train the seminarians into the complexity of married life so that they can guide couples with wisdom and love.15

---

2.5. Boundaries in Pastoral Relationships

One of the key areas that is related to sexual harassment and paedophilia is crossing of boundaries in relationships. Seminarians need to be made aware of and trained in maintaining clear boundaries which foster good pastoral relationships and beware of behaviour that fosters fuzzy boundaries and a crossing of boundaries which is harmful and at times criminal.

A particular area leading to exploitation and crossing of boundaries is dual relationships which can easily develop in pastoral contexts. A dual relationship is one in which a priest, seminarian or a religious attempts to fulfil two roles with the same person—for example, to have both a ministerial and a personal relationship with that person. Sexualized behaviour within a ministerial relationship or any attempt to sexualize a pastoral relationship automatically creates a dual relationship, regardless of who initiated the relationship.

A clear delineation of behavioural expectations appropriate to a life of celibacy must be part of formation goals during seminary education and also throughout priests’ time in ministry.

2.5.1 Examples of Behaviours which can be Crossing of Boundaries, Exploitation Leading at Times to Paedophilic Actions and therefore are Prohibited\(^{16}\)

- Using, possessing, or being under the influence of illegal drugs.
- Providing or allowing minors to consume alcohol or illegal drugs.
- Swearing or using foul language in the presence of minors.
- Speaking to minors in a way that is or could be construed by any observer as harsh, threatening, intimidating, shaming, demeaning, or humiliating.
- Engaging in any sexually oriented conversations with minors unless these are part of a legitimate lesson and discussion for teenagers regarding human sexuality issues.
- Being nude in the presence of minors.
- Possessing sexually oriented or morally inappropriate materials (magazines, cards, videos, films, electronic mail, other electronic images, clothing, etc.).

\(^{16}\)Songy, Workshop on Paedophilia at Bangalore 1-22 February 2020.
• Sleeping in the same beds, sleeping bags or small tents with minors.
• Engaging in sexual contact with minors.

**Off-site events**

• Religious are prohibited from transporting minors alone. When transporting several minors, written permission must be obtained from their parents or guardians.
• Religious/priests are prohibited from unnecessary and/or inappropriate physical contact with minors while in vehicles.
• When the necessary permission has been received, minors should be transported directly to their destination, that is, there should be no unplanned stops.
• Religious are prohibited from having minors stay at their residence.
• Changing and showering facilities or arrangements for religious must be separate from facilities or arrangements for minors.

2.5.2. **Inappropriate Forms of Affection**

• kissing on the mouth;
• holding minors over four years old on the lap;
• touching buttocks, chests or genital areas;
• showing affection in isolated or private areas such as offices, bedrooms, confessionals, sacristies, staff areas, etc.
• being in bed with a minor;
• touching knees or legs of minors;
• wrestling with minors;
• swimming alone with minors;
• tickling minors;
• piggyback rides;
• any type of massage given by minor to adult;
• any type of massage given by adult to minor;
• any form of unwanted affection;
• compliments that relate to physique or body development.

3.6. **Mentoring during Transition to Ministry**

The *Causes and Context* data of the John Jay College report indicate that abuse is most likely to occur at times of stress, loneliness, and
isolation. Such stressful or challenging situations triggered the desire in some priests to form inappropriate relationships with others—such relationships were most often with adults, but sometimes with minors.

The John Jay College report cites following stressful and challenging situations in the life of the newly ordained priest: *Transition to parish life* involving the transition from the communal and structured environment of seminary to the responsibilities and administrative challenges of daily parish life; *negative early parish life* where priests were assigned tasks for which they had no skills; *uprooting* from an established routine of a parish one was used to, to a problematic parish; *distance ministry* such as “rural” or “roving” ministry where the priests would be disconnected from the people they served; *family stress* referring to having to work away from one’s family such as parents and siblings; *poor self-care* as a result of the requirement to attend to many activities.

These situational stressors can lead to higher levels of vulnerability to abuse, and though they do not “cause” abuse, they may serve as “triggers.”

It is important that formation and accompaniment does not stop with ordination but arrangements are to be made for mentors and spiritual directors and regular on-going formation especially in the early stages of the priestly ministry.

3. Conclusion

The scandal/crisis of paedophilia by the clergy in the Catholic Church has been called the biggest crisis in the history of the Church since reformation. The problem has many ramifications. Many causes have been suggested. One of the main contributing factors seems to be the type of formation in seminaries which focused mainly on spiritual, intellectual and theological formation with a neglect of human formation.

The good news is that as reported by the John Jay College, the changes introduced in the seminary curriculum with more attention to human formation in the area of psychosexual integration in the recent past has had a very positive effect leading to diminishing cases of paedophilia among the catholic clergy. This has important consequences for Seminary curriculum.

Seminary formation needs to pay a particular attention to addressing intimacy deficit, boundaries in ministerial
relationships and ongoing formation as well as making the seminarians aware of the grave harm done to the victims of paedophilia by the clergy.

Considering the pivotal role played by the clergy in the life of the Catholic Church it is imperative that everything is done during seminary formation to foster psychosexual integration of the future priest so that the faithful can trust their children with their priests and the crisis does not recur.